

Book reviews

Before and after Boas

ADAMS, WILLIAM Y. *The Boasians: founding fathers and mothers of American anthropology*. xi, 343 pp., illus., bibliogr. Lanham, Md.: Rowman & Littlefield, 2016. £24.95 (paper)

Franz Boas, arrived in the United States from Germany in 1886 armed with a doctoral degree in psychophysics from the University of Kiel and a year of ethnographic, linguistic, and geographic fieldwork on Baffin Island. After a decade and a half of labour in precarious positions as editor, museum curator, lecturer, and researcher, he became a professor at Columbia University and from that base he produced the first generation of professional anthropologists who would go forth and multiply, establishing most of the early departments of anthropology in the country. Boas and his followers defined the discipline's scope and formulated its fundamental premises and guiding principles – ones that lasted at least until the political and intellectual revolutions of the late 1960s. Adams, writing in the current era when 'American anthropology has become more and more an activist discipline dedicated to protest and reform [and] the Boasian paradigm has vanished into the mists of time', sets out to write a "salvage ethnology" of Boasian anthropology itself, adding: 'My intent is to make the activities and the thought of these remarkable men and women intelligible within the context of their own time, not refracted through the lens of latter-day anthropology' (p. 16).

Adams states: 'My qualification to undertake this task stems from the fact that I am myself a second-generation Boasian; very possibly the last

one surviving' (p. 17). A student at Berkeley from 1946 to 1950, 'under the tutelage of Robert Lowie and in the shadow of A.L. Kroeber', he writes with a degree of familiarity and appreciation combined with the critical eye of one 'unsettled by the discovery of Chicago-derived anthropology at the University of Arizona a little later' (p. 17). Although seven years younger than Professor Adams, I share his familiarity with the Boasians: I also studied with A.L. Kroeber, shared an office with Melville Herskovits, and listened to a good number of Paul Radin's anecdotes.

This book is the first to encompass the works and ideas of both Franz Boas and the most notable of his numerous students and followers. In addition to a section on 'The founding grandfather', the book's chapters are dedicated to six of the most important men and three of the most prominent women, as well as shorter entries for another six 'Journeyman' and eight 'Handmaidens' (his terms). The 'founding fathers' are Clark Wissler, A.L. Kroeber, Robert Lowie, Edward Sapir, Melville J. Herskovits, and Paul Radin. The 'founding mothers' are the very eminent Ruth Benedict and Margaret Mead and the more obscure, but significant, Elsie Clews Parsons.

The chapters devoted to each of the major figures follow a general pattern, with sections about the principals' lives and career paths; their ethnographic and linguistic research; their personalities and influence; and their most significant ideas and writings. Adams presents useful summaries of many of the most important books and articles by these anthropologists and there is much to be learned from his accounts. All this is imparted in a style that is amiable, sometimes informal, and not infrequently negative. Adams is not so enamoured of his

subjects that the critical eye he developed after he left Berkeley loses its acuity. It is at this point that I, with a somewhat different critical approach, take exception to certain aspects of this engaging and useful book.

For example, the chapter about Franz Boas is dated with respect to both the great man's biography and the understanding of his thought and work. Adams seems unaware of Douglas Cole's 1999 excellent, but incomplete, biography of Boas (*Franz Boas: the early years, 1859–1906*), and of the quantity of sophisticated writing about his work and ideas that has been published over the past two decades. Adams consistently under-values – or misunderstands – Boas's approach to science, writing: 'He was not a theorist, and not always a scientist; he was an ideologue' (p. 4). This was the cry of early Boas critics, who were passionate about quantification and the notion that science must involve the search for laws of cause and effect. Boas, who contributed significantly to the development of statistics, geography, studies of human growth and physical variation, linguistics, as well as ethnology and anthropological theory, knew better.

Despite his sympathetic coverage of these anthropologists' work, Adams insists that the Boasians rejected 'theory-driven' approaches, pursuing a 'particularistic' natural history line of attack and collecting 'trait-lists' in an attempt to 'salvage' what they could of American Indian culture. This is a conventional over-generalization that deserves considerable modification. Similarly, Adams' repeated claim that the Boasian tradition was marked by 'political quietism' is contradicted by references in the book to the activism of many of Boas's followers.

We heirs to a modified Boasian tradition may argue over these matters, but William Adams has nevertheless produced a valuable work by marshalling so much information about the men and women who created the distinctive discipline that is (or was) American anthropology.

HERBERT S. LEWIS *University of Wisconsin-Madison*

HINSLEY, CURTIS M. & DAVID R. WILCOX (eds).

Coming of age in Chicago: the 1893 World's Fair and the coalescence of American anthropology. xlv, 574 pp., tables, illus., plates, bibliogr. Lincoln: Univ. of Nebraska Press, 2016. £56.00 (cloth)

Scholarship on the great world's fairs of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries has been growing steadily since the 1970s, and yet we seem only to have begun to learn what these

complex events (total social facts, we might say) can teach us as signs of their times. They certainly are significant for historians of anthropology.

Through their organization and exhibits, the fairs brought to life the socio-evolutionary worldview of the high imperialist era. Victorian anthropologists had a crucial role in constructing that worldview in displays of, and about, the non-Western peoples of the world who were marshalled to serve as evidence of the pre-history of white civilization and as proof of its superiority over all other kinds and stages of humanity.

This splendid volume brings together seven substantial essays which, taken together, treat the 1893 Chicago World's Fair as 'a catalytic event in the professionalization of American anthropology', as the editors put it (p. xix). They describe *fin-de-siècle* US society as 'a world of jealous localities and expansive urban power centers competing with one another while resisting the growing . . . influence of the federal government' (p. xx). The key local centres of anthropology were Philadelphia, Washington, and Cambridge, Massachusetts; while the anthropological patriarchs of those centres were, respectively, Daniel Garrison Brinton, John Wesley Powell, and Frederic Ward Putnam. Their contributions to the fair are analysed in essays by Curtis Hinsley on Putnam and Brinton, and David Wilcox on Frank Hamilton Cushing, who worked for, among others, Powell's Bureau of Ethnology of the Smithsonian Institution.

Ira Jacknis and James Snead contribute two essays, quite different but equally fascinating, on the material culture of the fair. Jacknis's essay on 'refracting images' as evidenced in architecture and mannequins examines not unique museum objects, but the 'endlessly repeatable' analogue imitations that so fascinated the Victorians (pp. 262–3), as, for instance, in photographs of plaster casts of decorative architectural fragments from ancient Greece. Snead focuses on relics and relic hunters, with particular attention to the careers of Richard Wetherill, who proved unable to use the fair as a stepping-stone to the new world of professional archaeology, and Warren King Moorehead, who successfully negotiated the transition.

The final two essays and Hinsley's afterword analyse the fair as a site, and moment, of the institutionalization of professional anthropology. Donald McVicker's essay on 'Patrons, popularizers, and professionals' highlights the 'puzzle' (p. 376) that anthropology posed to wealthy businessmen who were also philanthropists: was anthropology a science or a 'big show' of exotic objects? He sketches the

central role of philanthropists, for whom the fair provided the impetus for the founding of the Field Columbian Museum, but not for the support of university anthropology. Anthropology's institutional consolidation is charted in the final essay by Wilcox, which depicts the fair as 'pivotal' (p. 413) in the process of transforming anthropology from a field anchored in local amateur institutions and organizations to a professional discipline situated primarily in universities.

These seven essays by themselves would constitute an important contribution, but the editors have contextualized them by adding key documents of the moment by anthropologists such as Putnam, Brinton, Cushing, and Boas, as well as seventy-one splendid illustrations, including 'A visual interlude' curated by Hinsley and composed of cartoons and sketches of the fair taken from mass media.

Although there is no essay devoted to Boas, he is everywhere in this volume, at least implicitly, both as Putnam's 'principal assistant' at the fair (p. 130) and as the young professional scholar who would go on to challenge and then dismantle Victorian socio-evolutionary anthropology. Perhaps the most fascinating of the contemporary documents is an essay by Boas that originally appeared in *Cosmopolitan Magazine* on 'Ethnology at the Exposition' (1893). In his dry yet ever so perspicacious prose, Boas neatly analysed the conflict between a big show of exotica and a science of anthropology. 'The former', he wrote, 'is unavoidably pursued in all portions of an exposition which have a commercial interest' ('even', he added, 'in art exhibits'), while the latter presented 'a systematic series of exhibits covering a certain field', in this case, 'the history of civilizations' (p. 78). Illustrative of Boas's developing concern for culturally specific museum displays, 'Ethnology at the Exposition' also rings true (hauntingly) to the situation of the university in the early twenty-first century, threatened as it is by a triumphant capitalism.

RICHARD HANDLER *University of Virginia*

VERMEULEN, HAN F. *Before Boas: the genesis of ethnography and ethnology in the German Enlightenment*. xxii, 718 pp., maps, illus., tables, bibliogr. Lincoln: Univ. of Nebraska Press, 2015. £65.00 (cloth)

The late Ernest Gellner often likened the period before and after Malinowski to the Old and New Testaments. After Malinowski, we have a fairly good idea of how to trace the different historical

connections back to his inspiration. For the time before, our excursions into history tend to revolve around discussions of odd prophets and may be rather murky and difficult. Yet must that early anthropology always be so opaque? Han Vermeulen thinks not. In this majestic new work, which runs to some 450 pages of text, and 200 pages of references in many languages, he puts forward a clear thesis: that ethnography recognizably began in eighteenth-century Eastern Europe, specifically in Austria, Germany, and Russian Siberia. From there, it spread out to Europe more widely, then eventually to Britain. Persuasively, he further discerns many subtle shifts in the way that anthropology, ethnography, ethnology, and the various terms associated with these subjects were understood, arguing in particular that the racist element was a later, largely nineteenth-century, insertion. By the time that Boas became interested in anthropology, it had settled down to a four-field model, which he was famously able to build upon on his arrival to the United States. That same model arrived in Britain rather earlier, in time for the institutionalization of anthropology through various museums and indeed the Royal Anthropological Institute, which remains a four-field institution to this day.

Thus, though the work has a wonderful title, the operative word is the *Before* rather than the *Boas*. Those looking for a biography of Boas will have to seek elsewhere, for instance the fine work by Douglas Cole (*Franz Boas: the early years, 1859-1906*, 1999), of which only the first volume was finished before its author's death. What Vermeulen's book very clearly underlines is that while Boas is credited with founding professional anthropology in America, he was not attempting to create an American anthropology. For him, anthropology was an all-encompassing global inquiry that need know no national boundaries. It was therefore anthropology *per se* that Boas sought to professionalize, whether through the American Anthropological Association, the Americanist Congress, the field school in Mexico, his remaining colleagues in Germany, or the International Union of Anthropological and Ethnological Sciences, for which he helped act as the founding stimulus when he proposed to the Royal Anthropological Institute that the Americanist Congress to be held in London in 1912 should expand to consider questions of general anthropological import. It is this devotion to an international scholarly discourse that led him into his well-known difficulties during the Great War in America, and to his later courageous stance against National Socialism in

the Second World War. The roots, however, of this transnational ethos lie in German scholarship and the Enlightenment to which it gave rise.

Vermeulen treats these issues in eight chapters, beginning with a general overview of the history of anthropology and ethnology. He then turns to Leibniz's interaction with Russia; Messerschmidt's and then Mueller's explorations in Siberia; Niebuhr and the Danish-German expeditions to the Arab lands; Schloezer and the invention of ethnology; and two final chapters which look firstly at the development of anthropology in the German Enlightenment, and then its reception more widely. A careful conclusion summarizes the book's main findings. These scholarly chapters can each be read as separate essays, for they are full of carefully reasoned nuggets that are greatly stimulating. Amongst these, one may note Vermeulen's perceptive remark that at the outset anthropology was not about alterity at all, but rather about understanding human cultures in the round, wherever they may be.

Generally, the argument is convincing. The framework that it uses is a diffusionist one: that the spread of ethnography from a particular part of Europe and its heartland can be traced. Against this theoretical position it may be possible to take the long tradition of British speculative writings of travel and exploration and see this as a specific stimulus for anthropology independent of any continental tradition, a contrast that would take us back to the lively arguments of the 1920s (G.E. Smith *et al.*, *Culture: the diffusion controversy*, 1928). Overall, though, it is refreshing that Vermeulen should use an earlier anthropological technique to illuminate the genesis of modern anthropology. This highly original and valuable work would be an excellent foundation text for any course on the history of anthropology, and one can only wish it the great success that it surely deserves.

DAVID SHANKLAND *Royal Anthropological Institute*

Foodways

KIM, KWANG OK (ed.). *Re-orienting cuisine: East Asian foodways in the twenty-first century*. 296 pp., illus., tables, bibliogr. Oxford, New York: Berghahn Books, 2015. £60.00 (cloth)

This volume, edited by Kwang Ok Kim, uses food to explore social change in Asia, suggesting that cuisines, food habits, and culinary traditions are actively being shaped (and reshaped) by individual consumers and other actors in the

local, national, regional, and, at times, global food system. *Re-orienting cuisine* is composed of fourteen chapters and divided into three parts. The book begins with an introduction in which Kim mischaracterizes – and downplays – the growing importance of food studies and food as a mode and method of study. This is a shame and somewhat of a missed opportunity as food is no longer a secondary field; for many scholars, including several represented in this volume, it is the primary and ongoing source of inquiry.

Part I, 'National/local food in the (re)making', examines how identities are constructed through food practices at the global, national, and local levels. Moon (chap. 1) describes the popularization of Korean royal court cuisine during the 1990s as part of the country's broader efforts to create a distinct national identity as it gained prominence in the global economy. Similarly Hsiao and Lim (chap. 2) look at Malaysia and Taiwan as case studies for how multi-ethnic societies use national cuisines in constructing unified national identities. DeBernardi (chap. 3) argues that the development of Wudang Daoist tea culture in China can be placed alongside the government-driven development of Wudang Mountain as a historic tourism site. Kim (chap. 4) shows that new types of *bap* (cooked rice) and rice-based foodstuffs in South Korea should be viewed as the revival of local culture.

The essays in part II, 'Food practice across cultural boundaries', deal with how new cultural spaces and meanings are derived through migration and exchange: what happens to foods when they leave home. Han (chap. 5) traces the rise of instant noodles (*ramyeon*) in Korean foodways. Wu (chap. 6) discusses the domestication of Japanese cuisine in Taiwan, while Caldwell (chap. 7) investigates the domestication of Chinese, Japanese, and, notably, Korean foods in Russia, in what she terms the 'Easternization' of Russian foodways. In Bulgaria, eating Chinese food represents normalcy and re-engagement with the West after post-socialism (Jung, chap. 8); while 'ethnic restaurants' in Korea have challenged consumers to reconsider food consumption and identity (Bak, chap. 9). Herzfeld (chap. 10) aligns material tastes with social tastes by showing how in Thailand the taste for spice is correlated with socioeconomic status.

The final section, on 'Health, safety, and food consumption', shows how these terms take on different meanings in local discourses. The rise of the well-being discourse in Korea has led to new consumption habits (Yang, chap. 11). Cheung's (chap. 12) accounts of crayfish farming establish how issues of health, ecology, and food safety

play out differently in China versus Japan. Klein (chap. 13) suggests that 'eating green' in urban China is a response to changes in urban food supply and development. In tandem, Yan (chap. 14) discusses the ever-present fear of 'poison' food in China – which he argues is a consequence of modernization, an increasingly long food chain, and social distrust.

My single critique of the book is that the title is somewhat misleading. This volume focuses mostly on mainland China (and the Chinese diaspora) and South Korea. To illustrate, Japan is mentioned cursorily, yet there are chapters on the reception of Chinese food in Bulgaria and the domestication of Chinese, Japanese, and Korean cuisines into Russian foodways. I draw attention to the title because one of the major themes in this volume is the transnational spread of material culture, foodways, and the renegotiation of social identities and habits through these changes. The subject of the title raises broader issues: perhaps old labels like East Asia are no longer adequate because variants of East Asian cuisine, as the contributors convincingly argue, now appear in many parts of the world; it is unrealistic (and unfair) to think of them as categorically 'pure' and separate from other foodways. Instead, as this volume correctly highlights, the richness is in seeing how these interconnections and migrations pan out when actors renegotiate their relationships to these foods and to their local foodways.

Overall, this volume provides rich ethnographic and descriptive material for any scholar interested in Asian foodways. This work is a welcome addition to the ever-growing cannon on food scholarship in Asia.

WILLA ZHEN *Culinary Institute of America*

KLEIN, JAKOB A. & ANNE MURCOTT (eds). *Food consumption in global perspective: essays in the anthropology of food in honour of Jack Goody*. 230 pp., illus., bibliogr. London: Palgrave, 2014. £68.00 (cloth)

This volume is both an appreciation of Jack Goody's ground-breaking studies on social class and food, and an extension into spaces and systems unexamined in his work. Inspired by Goody, these detailed observations by food anthropologists offer rich material in 'the minutiae of everyday eating practices' (p. 6). The book also shows how far we have come in the study of food and represents the subject's full flowering.

The juxtapositions of tradition and transformation in culinary cultures are well

exhibited in Watson's presentation of meat's 'cultural biography' in China. Watson looks at how meat has changed from an elite, privileged foodstuff to a different sort of community affirmation; and at commensality in the face of changing urban-rural food cultures in Hong Kong through a dish that has been transposed to the city from the countryside. Similarly, Fufu, the staple starch of Ghana, discussed by Clark, has become so common amongst both rich and poor that it has changed from being a dish almost below mention to a dish of identity, now more noticeable by its absence during ritual fasting than by its ubiquitous presence.

Staples' chapter on South Indian rituals of commensality notes a shift from caste- to class-based practice. The sources of change include the exposure to bottled sauces, pizza, and Pepsi; the increased frequency of cosmopolitanizing travel; and the consequent introduction of new tastes and food communities. Abbotts' work in Ecuador demonstrates another way of looking at class and change in food, through the diversification of views of what is local and what is global in a society. Is the very local dish of cuy (guinea pig), formerly despised by the European-facing elites, more valued now that world-class chefs have embraced it? Abbotts also illustrates the complex relationship between the local and global through the example of KFC in Ecuador, which uses 'a local grammar' by serving Cuencano stew and rice in a fast-food context, thus demonstrating that the global can keep local food traditions alive.

Cookbooks can create a sense of nation and – employed mostly by educated middle-class cooks, curious and aspirational – they are tools for change. In Sobral's chapter, Portuguese cookbooks reflect both high and low cuisines, cosmopolitanism and rootedness, while creating a national culinary canon. They also demonstrate how Portuguese products themselves have entered a global menu.

Mennell's outlying – but fascinating – chapter draws in part from his earlier work on food and culture. Treating indigestion as historical and subject to changing cultural beliefs, he shows that social practices, perpetuated through the 'intergenerational transmission of anxiety', have produced osmophobia and geumaphobia, leading to bland diets and the 'trained incapacity to enjoy food', especially in the Anglosphere. Pottier's discussion of diasporic class divisions in Bangladeshi restaurants in East London also considers the power of the senses: not their denial, but understanding their power to 'reek' of identity. Both West and East Bengali foods, the

first sweet and seductive, the second fiery, have niche markets, while the more generalized subcontinental Indian restaurants lack these specific identifiers.

Sabban's discussion of powdered milk is a scholarly history of the concepts of purity and pollution. It is interesting to read that '[milk] is a genuine human, that is, manufactured, food', and to think how it is also a human, that is, natural, food – consider breast milk. Cultural and economic change are mapped in the move from the avoidance of dairy products to the high levels of processed milk production. Not milk but alcohol is the drink discussed in Zubaida's story of drinking cultures and spaces in Muslim societies. Using Goody's formulations of use and exclusion in alcohol, Zubaida notes that while in Muslim Sudan, beer is seen as 'liquid bread', and not subject to Muslim restrictions, in other Muslim cultures, where the restriction is observed, elite drinking spaces have created a new etiquette of drinking in public.

In part, then, this volume considers globalization's role, not only as it affects local foodways, but also as local foodways make their way onto the global menu. Global homogenization meets cultural and social differentiation as sources of proliferating innovation. These essays show that large- and small-scale human migration and industrial development, urbanization, and the changes wrought by 'cosmopolitanization', as well as revivalism in culinary cultures, are at play on the food stage – sometimes simultaneously. Highly recommended, this unusually well-integrated volume offers academic researchers, students, and general readers a rich collection of data and thoughtful analysis, while both celebrating a great scholar and providing new territory for exploration.

MERRY I. WHITE *Boston University*

WILSON, MARIA. *Everyday moral economies: food, politics and scale in Cuba*. 232 pp., illus., tables, bibliogr. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell, 2014. £24.99 (paper)

If I had to evaluate *Everyday moral economies* in just two words, these would most probably be 'useful' and 'balanced'. Useful because to my knowledge it is the most comprehensive treatment on the theme of food consumption and production in Cuba, providing valuable information on the theme from both historical and contemporary perspectives. Balanced because, although it deals with an utterly political

side of Cuba and the Revolution, it does not hastily take sides between a (neo)liberal or a socialist mode of production and political organization. On the contrary, it forms an interesting alternative to the long-expressed, but not-yet-fulfilled, prophecy that heralded the transition of Cuban socialism towards a more capitalist and liberal-friendly economy. Wilson highlights the complex coexistence of both models on the island: firstly, as a matter of necessity owing to external pressures; and, secondly, as a creative way, even if in tension, of sustaining Cuba's socialist basis.

The historical overview begins in chapter 2. Such a perspective provides invaluable detail on the story of the struggle for national sovereignty, a process (never fully achieved) which began with Cuban's independence. Therefore an important 'nationalist' dimension is given to the Revolution which complements the more distinctively socialist ideological elements. Food production and distribution are ultimately incorporated as important factors in the more general process of creating a particular Cuban 'moral economy', or, as the author terms it, evoking Hobbes: Leviathan.

With this as a background, four ethnographic chapters (chaps 3-6) follow. In these are delineated the everyday intricacies of Cuban life, wherein official discourses about how to produce a simple and free (or cheap) food distribution network are met by, and often contrasted with, scarcity, private (albeit illegal) initiatives, uneven access, alternative individual or collective desires and moral evaluations, informal local networks, and global forces. Through these chapters it is shown with great clarity that 'market' and 'non-market' practices coexist critically (not unproblematically nor unreflexively), and even creatively, within the Cuban state. Chapter 6 details an interesting case study of small-scale Cuban farmers who are part of the 'agroecology movement'. By creating a sustainable, more efficacious small farming sector, while still aiming for fair distribution, this movement aims to bypass some of the obstacles that are the result of the government's extreme centralization of food production. Again, all the intricacies, challenges, paradoxes, and tensions are unravelled 'on the ground'.

A good summary of these processes is offered by Wilson herself in the conclusion: 'Cuba is a laboratory for the kind of research that seeks to map out multiple and shifting economic logics and practices in everyday life. On a more formal level, socialism and liberalism coexist in Cuba as competing "social relations of value" with different bases and spatialities' (p. 181). Such a balanced view, backed up with ethnography and

displaying a historical consciousness, is definitely a productive path to take. However, this is a bit of a conceptual tightrope to walk and some drawbacks can be identified. As a human geographer, Wilson lays claim to a more politically attuned vision (drawing some 'normative conclusions', as she says on p. xiv), while as an anthropologist, she asserts a kind of comparative or culturally attuned 'neutrality'. As far as the latter is concerned, I would have liked some more in-depth ethnographic insights into the cultural value of food consumption, perhaps linked to a term which Wilson under-elaborates: that of Cuban kinship (in its more literal and metaphorical senses, as she mentions). As for the former, a more critical and political methodology could have been suggested, without necessarily sacrificing the extremely balanced approach of the whole book.

It is absolutely valid (even, one might argue, imperative) to not ascribe to either a neoliberal or a traditionally socialist vision of food production and redistribution. Monopoly and centralization, whether private or of the state, create significant social obstacles. The ethnographic observation that people may shift levels and dimensions ('scales', as Wilson calls it) in their everyday lives is well taken, but, as an explanation of norms, it is not, I believe, sufficient. In fact, I think that the over-theorization of the 'everyday' can be problematic in its perpetual fuzziness. Are there any alternatives that can be gleaned? Chapter 6 with its case study of agroecology farming provides a possible ethnographic answer to this question. Perhaps some more space could have been devoted to discussing this example and thus developing a more politically framed analysis.

ANASTASIOS PANAGIOTOPOULOS *Universidade Nova de Lisboa*

Heritage and history

BAUGHER, SHERENE & RICHARD F. VEIT. *The archaeology of American cemeteries and gravemarkers*. 254 pp., illus., bibliogr. Gainesville: Univ. Press of Florida, 2014. £68.50 (cloth)

Baughner and Veit's book both is a reminder that we have never been equal in death and also promotes the academic scholarship of historical archaeology and of the (North American) Association for Gravestone Studies (founded in 1977). Given that I am aligned with European 'death studies', I already appreciate their point on how cemetery design and management histories

are both diverse and reflect the sociocultural history and geography in which they are located. Additionally, this book provides an interesting colonial and settler history of the United States through gravesites and markers. It also provides a fascinating read for those interested in the intellectual history of American historical archaeology and gravestone studies.

As a social anthropologist with a limited background in archaeology, I found the ethical and historical discussion of 'belowground archaeology' undertaken by European colonists fascinating, albeit distressing. Descendant communities must have been relieved when the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act (NAGPRA) was passed in 1990. However, whilst the authors state that NAGPRA has 'radically restructured not only the way archaeologists interact with Native American communities regarding the discovery and treatment of burials but also how archaeologists work with other descendant communities and their cemeteries' (p. 25), the 'collaborative' means of working with descendant communities essentially remains uncritically discussed and, therefore, unconvincing. What do 'co-operation' and 'collaboration' really mean and entail for contemporary belowground archaeology concerning human remains and (sacred) burial sites? One hopes that it means more than archaeologists simply 'communicating' with 'descendant communities' (p. 34), otherwise archaeologists undertaking excavations of burial places today could find themselves repeating colonial history. Perhaps it is time to bury the 'belowground' perspective and method in archaeology, to cease the digging and disturbance, and to relinquish power as arbiters of the past? This book certainly prompts such questions, because Baughner and Veit demonstrate that there remain many unresolved ethical dilemmas in an archaeology focused on human remains and places of burial: quite literally, bones of contention still loom large.

Given that this book provides an overview of the ethical, historical, and political issues concerning the exhumation and study of human remains and burial places, it makes ideal reading for archaeology, anthropology, and sociology students with an interest in death and mortuary cultures; moreover, it is very comprehensible, with each chapter providing interesting case studies. However, whilst the case studies are fascinating, they generally are descriptive and lack theoretical depth. Subsequently, this book is best read as a general overview or introduction to historical archaeology

and cemetery research. I also found the temporal categories for historical time problematic, again in their simplicity and thus generalizing capacity ('pre-industrial', 'industrial', and post-industrial', etc.); and whilst I entirely agree with the authors that class cannot be ignored in the study of gravemarkers, a definition and critique of class are absent. Thus categories such as 'middle class' and 'blue-collar worker' are used uncritically. Similarly, as the authors state, ethnic and religious identity markers need to be used with caution to 'prevent archaeologists from lumping an ethnic or religious group into one catch-all category' (p. 199); rather, they need to develop a more robust, sophisticated analysis of burial and memorialization histories. This is a hostage to fortune given that Baugher and Veit's ethnically inclusive attempts to present a broad history of burial cultures present in nineteenth- and twentieth-century America (chap. 6) are discussed under the following subheadings: Native Americans, African Americans, Chinese Americans, Hawaiians, Jews, Spanish Catholics, Mexican Americans, Romany/Gypsy, and Italian Americans.

Whilst this book provides an expansive overview of America's colonial and settler history from a historical archaeological concern with gravemarkers and burial grounds – and thus demonstrates their value as rich repositories of cultural and historical knowledge – it is too narrowly focused on cemeteries and gravestones alone. In my view, the lack of consideration given to cremation is a glaring omission. Although I agree with the authors that American cemeteries are worth studying as historical repositories, this cultural history remains partial if only focused on burial cultures, for not all Americans and their descendants subscribed to a burial culture; vying, alternative forms of body disposal (which do not get mentioned in this book) mean that there will always be Americans in the future who will also be written out of this history. Nevertheless, this book is the most valuable survey of American archaeological research on gravemarkers and cemeteries to date, from which other disciplines can subsequently draw, and, more importantly, to which they can contribute.

HANNAH RUMBLE *University of Bristol*

KAMMEN, DOUGLAS. *Three centuries of conflict in East Timor*. xv, 231 pp., tables, figs, illus., bibliogr. London, New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers Univ. Press, 2015. £51.50 (cloth)

This book challenges the assumption underlying much recent Timor-Leste scholarship that Timorese people have long acted in accord with a

widely shared narrative that holds the nation at its centre. Drawing readers into an intriguing story of intertwined families, political alliances, and place-bound settlements, Kammen rejects teleological explanations for the recurrent mass violence in the island's history that culminated in the eventual formation of the nation-state of Timor-Leste. He instead invites readers to consider the causes and actors involved in violence across the past three centuries. Rather than assuming that all instances of violence were expressions of anti-colonial struggle or emanating from a coalescing nationalism, Kammen asks: 'Why was there violence, and who produced it?' This point of departure demonstrates how the subjectivities of vibrant characters have changed across time.

Three centuries of conflict in East Timor focuses on the small region of Maubara in the centre of Timor's north coast. Owing to the changing tides of territorial control and Timorese efforts to seek locally advantageous supralocal trade and political alliances, Maubara eventually became a Dutch enclave, and was later formally exchanged between Dutch and Portuguese powers. Kammen compiled genealogies of multiple Maubara families, collected oral accounts about past and recent events, and brought these into conversation with both Portuguese and Dutch colonial archives. Taking a place-based perspective, he describes events imbued with local significance that were sometimes at odds with – or unrelated to – forming or taking on some identity as members of the nation. Tracing this history indicates how local conditions impelled a range of responses towards the European powers, from willing or even fervent allegiance, to a strong refusal to be colonized. Over three centuries, the significant variation in efforts to embrace and to resist colonial rule highlights the complex effects experienced by local populations caught in an extended territorial dispute.

Using a microhistorical approach, this book reveals important gaps in the historical record (e.g. on indigenous populations' perceptions of the Dutch-Portuguese colonial struggle), and highlights the wide variation in local responses across time. For those familiar with the progression of significant dates in Timorese history, Kammen shows that even the interstices of well-known wars were riddled with a degree of constantly simmering conflict that found new ways to replicate long-standing alliances and rivalries. The reader might ask whether the violence was recurrent or nearly uninterrupted, with multiple manifestations.

Maubara's history shows that this small district was not parochial, but globally networked.

Precedence and authority are seen to be malleable across time, as local actors aligned with outside powers for reasons that had little to do with rhetoric or policy at higher levels. The interplay of contentious indigenous authority; variable colonial interventions; conspiracies involving African soldiers; as well as the social and economic influences of Chinese merchants – all form part of the background to changing political outcomes. Local or customary authority is not contraposed to political power; rather, it is presented as modified through external backing in the form of political appointments; gifts of objects of rule that became sacred heirlooms; and the possession of colonial documents that shaped and propelled local leaders' authority. Long-standing local rivalries (which continue to exist) translated into shifting support through political transitions: historical family feuds have taken new forms as settlements and lineages join opposing political parties. Post-independence, some East Timorese and international efforts to pursue justice and to engage customary authorities in conflict resolution have served to bring disputes into relief and even to reignite old conflicts. Focus on the national narrative obscures actions that were evidently more about local positioning *vis-à-vis* other settlements and prominent lineages than about allegiance to national ideals.

Interviews referenced throughout this engaging text serve to humanize and to historicize both the victims and perpetrators of mass violence; the artfully told stories of individual people make up the collective. Timor scholars will appreciate this detailed examination of how one region of the island is situated within wider regional and colonial histories, with contextualizing threads drawn throughout that will inform the study of other regions and rulers across Timor. Kammen's intensive analysis usefully highlights pitfalls that others using Timor's colonial archives may encounter. There is periodic reflection on why events important in the archives are absent in oral histories, and vice versa. This book will inspire readers to interrogate their own research sites in two new directions: how the extended stories of prominent local families are a window into understanding alliances and rivalries; and how supralocal movements were or were not related to local priorities and events.

LAURA S. MEITZNER YODER *Wheaton College*

LAFRENZ SAMUELS, KATHRYN & TRINIDAD RICO
(eds). *Heritage keywords: rhetoric and
redescription in cultural heritage*. xx, 309 pp.,

map, tables, illus., bibliogr. Boulder: Univ.
Press of Colorado, 2015. £28.84 (paper)

Kathryn Lafrenz Samuels and Trinidad Rico's edited volume gives readers a fresh focus on language to the growing literature on heritage studies. This remarkably consistent collection brings together fifteen 'keywords' in a theoretical frame that Lafrenz Samuels' introduction and Rico's conclusion sketch out. Going against the expansion and codification of prevailing heritage vocabularies, the editors (and contributors) approach heritage as rhetoric in order to grasp its semantic fluidity and solidification in applied and academic contexts. *Heritage keywords* thus collects concept-driven case studies that approximate scholarly and practitioner concerns. The essays proffer hermeneutical, constructivist approaches of critical heritage scholarship to practitioners constrained by institutionally mediated dynamics of conceptual change.

An explicit play on Raymond Williams' *Keywords* (1976), the volume engages in historical semantics, albeit on a much smaller temporal scale than Williams did, and with a rather different aim. Besides following the semantic trajectories of popular heritage lingo, the volume aspires to carry out an 'intervention' in the solidification of meanings (p. 4), particularly in normative contexts of institutional heritage practice. The editors suggest that because of their pragmatic reliance on clearly defined concepts, institutions often cannot recognize 'epistemological cycles' through which heritage vocabularies are revitalized in other (e.g. academic) contexts (p. 286).

The volume's focus on fluidity, redescription, and 'conceptual decentralization', and its assertion that expertise is a rhetorical device (p. 288), firmly place it within the critical heritage studies literature. However, as Rico states in her conclusion, focusing on rhetoric ensures ample attention to semantic transitions – processes whereby rhetorical terms gain vernacularized meanings, strategic validity for subaltern contexts, and so on. Lane's (chap. 16) and Cooper's (chap. 10) contributions are particularly strong in this respect. *Heritage keywords* offers a richer insight into heritage on the ground than the literature that routinely maintains the dichotomy between the authorized heritage discourse and subaltern voices. However, the volume treats notions such as expertise, power, or hegemony in a rather shallow manner. A partial exemption is Cooper's discussion of heritage discourses, which criticizes the monolithic character of the authorized heritage discourse as it appears in day-to-day

policy-making in Scotland, in order to demarcate the power which that rhetoric might have in producing competitive accounts.

Contributors each approach their respective keywords differently: some illuminate them by tracing further interlinked notions; others tease out conceptual complexities through case studies. An elegant example of the former approach is Van der Auwera's discussion of Kosovo's civil society (chap. 3). She gives a twist to customary connotations of the phrase 'civil society' by elucidating its role in armed conflict, as it is invoked by both protectors and looters. Samuels (chap. 7) on difficult heritage follows the latter approach, elaborating on the everyday ambivalence with which Sicilians live with a Fascist heritage. Drawing out the ethical complexities this entails in everyday life, he urges us to minimize the dramatizing rhetoric which our conceptual assumptions often make at the expense of local nuance.

Bauer's (chap. 5), Rodéhn's (chap. 6), and Lafrenz Samuels' (chap. 15) essays share a focus on conceptual analysis. Bauer examines how property law favours the owner rather than the object, and shows the difference entailed in naming something cultural property rather than heritage. Lafrenz Samuels demonstrates how international heritage funding intensified the civil rights abuses of the Tunisian Ben Ali regime; while Rodéhn surveys the scholarly publications on museum democratization that are themselves used in these processes. McGill's (chap. 4), Adams' (chap. 8), Baird's (chap. 13), Rico's (chap. 9), and Karlström's (chap. 2) contributions follow the established critical heritage studies line of deconstructing cultural diversity, equity in international heritage management, and the discourses of nature, risk, and authenticity. These contributions show how universalizing constructs fail to adapt to particular tangential contexts. While these chapters add to the textual awareness of the volume, their lines of reasoning are politically tendentious and less surprising than those mentioned above. Moshenska (chap. 12), Preucel and Pecos (chap. 14), and Lane (chap. 10) all focus on heritage imageries; showing how people's ideas about, and memories of, cultural sites contribute to the rhetorical aspects of heritage. Finally, Zehbe's (chap. 11) essay sets up a rather unfortunate, if unexpected, parallel between brain-damaged persons and intangible heritage.

On the whole, the volume's critical deconstructivist agenda and its grassroots sympathies are less surprising than the often genuinely novel points at which contributors

arrive through their careful semantic analyses and linguistically minded case studies. Such sensitivities bring a fresh insight to much of the critical heritage literature, which too often tends to produce its own parlance while deconstructing that of others.

DIÁNA VONNÁK *Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology*

MORROW, SEÁN. *The fires beneath: the life of Monica Wilson, South African anthropologist*. xviii, 443 pp., maps, plates, bibliogr. London, Cape Town: Penguin Books, 2016. £17.50 (cloth)

Monica Wilson died exactly two months before I was born. Like her, I grew up on a southern African mission station – a long day's drive from Lovedale – and found myself drawn to anthropology while at university abroad. I encountered her work for the first time in 2006 while in graduate school. I still remember sitting in the library reading room with a pile of books that she had co-authored with her husband, Godfrey. I was impressed and captivated by her close attention to ethnographic detail, without learning much about her. While I knew she was one of South Africa's most important early anthropologists, Monica Wilson the person remained obscured.

It wasn't until I read the historiography of South African anthropology – Adam Kuper's *Anthropologists and anthropology* (1983) and W.D. Hammond-Tooke's *Imperfect interpreters* (1997) – that I began to sense the trajectory of Wilson's intellectual life and the role she has played in the discipline. The recent edited volume *Inside African anthropology* (eds A. Banks & L.J. Banks, 2013) further fleshes out this picture with its specific focus on her remarkable life and work. However, Morrow's *The fires beneath* stands out as a truly decisive contribution: a detailed, full-length biography, drawing deeply on archival material, a rich trove of letters, and more than fifty interviews in order to present an intimate and fascinating portrait of Monica Wilson.

The book's real ballast – its narrative core and probably its most important contribution – lies in the attention given to Monica's profound and tumultuous relationship with Godfrey. Morrow tells of how the young Godfrey pursued Monica with a strange, almost aggressive persistence. Monica's initial resistance – turning down his first proposals – only seemed to spur him on: 'I am going to make you love me', he writes in one of his typically histrionic letters, frightening Monica

with his desperation. Despite his intelligence and charm, Godfrey reveals himself to be cloying and deeply insecure, given to bouts of depression. He pursued a degree in Anthropology at the London School of Economics – where he became one of Malinowski's favourite students – mostly in hope of impressing Monica. When she finally agreed to marry him, it appeared to be more out of resignation than of love. Yet their relationship blossomed and their minds melded in deep collaboration.

Morrow's account also gives us a glimpse of the shifting fortunes of the Wilsons' work. Monica, conducting pioneering fieldwork in Pondoland, started off as the more talented and accomplished anthropologist, while Godfrey struggled with feelings of inadequacy in her shadow. Then during their time in Nyasaland he came into his own. Indeed, despite having neither degree nor monograph to his name, Godfrey – beneficiary of male privilege and Malinowski's enthusiastic support – leapfrogged over Monica in the world of British anthropology. He won the directorship of the Rhodes-Livingston Institute, and Monica slid reluctantly into the role of housewife. Godfrey's advantage may have been unearned, but he was ambitious – certainly more so than Monica – and he appeared to be on his way to becoming a brilliant, influential figure in the discipline until his demons came rushing back during his time in the war, and he took his own life.

In the end, it was Monica who made the biggest mark on anthropology. Morrow's book reveals that, unlike the many anthropologists caught up in Malinowski's orbit, she was never besotted with functionalism, having little time for grand theories about native life. While some were content to study black South Africans as if they lived in a timeless bubble, Monica insisted on foregrounding their interface with colonialism and capitalism. Her focus on social change was far ahead of its time, and although she never acquired the fame that some of her more charismatic contemporaries enjoyed, she had a deep and lasting influence on the discipline in this direction.

Morrow's book is an impressive achievement – a treasure of facts and observations about the Wilsons' life – yet I found myself wanting more. He approaches the work more as a historian than a biographer, compiling details in careful chronological order, leaving us with relatively little sense of character and narrative. One wonders whether the book might feel more alive if he had stepped back from the minute details and told a story instead. Moreover, Morrow offers little by

way of interpretation or argument, and does not engage much with other scholars. Perhaps his approach befits his subject – after all, Monica was known to shirk theory in favour of faithful ethnographic observation. In any case, it will be up to others to interpret more thoroughly the life that Morrow has so rigorously documented.

JASON HICKEL *London School of Economics and Political Science*

MOYER, TERESA S. *Ancestors of worthy life: plantation slavery and black heritage at Mount Clare*. xvii, 217 pp., maps, tables, illus., bibliogr. Gainesville: Univ. Press of Florida, 2015. £73.50 (cloth)

The American landscape is littered with manor houses that once were plantations and are now museums. At most of these one pays a fee to learn about the lives of the manor's owners, rather than of those who worked there. Visitors get to admire the furnishings and the luxurious lives of the 'enslavers' (the term Teresa Moyer prefers instead of 'master' or 'mistress'), but rarely have the opportunity to discover how the work of the 'enslaved' made those lives possible, much less anything equivalent about what those struggling under their enslavement did to survive as human beings. To Moyer, a historical archaeologist who works for the National Park Service, this reflects and deepens a fundamental inequity in the American collective memory. Black lives do not matter to those who became, and continue to be, the caretakers of these sites which claim to represent a revolutionary era in national identity.

There are exceptions, of course. Moyer nods to work being done on redressing this imbalance at prominent house museums such as Monticello and Mount Vernon. Such places have global audiences and are recognized as caretakers of a national history, and they are eager to work towards racial reconciliation through reimagining the collective past. Nevertheless, most manors remain in more provincial hands. Moyer explores one such local site, Mount Clare, based in Carroll Park in Baltimore, which has a two-thirds majority of African American residents. Now Mount Clare is a museum run by members of the National Society of the Colonial Dames of America, a mostly all-white heritage organization. This particular park, designed by the renowned Frederick Law Olmsted in the early 1900s as a place where the urban classes could reconnect with nature via strolling and sports, currently sits in the centre of an African American

neighbourhood. Black people use the park: they picnic or play basketball, but they ignore the manor. There is something pathetic about a museum that is open to the public but which cannot attract the public who live around it.

Moyer devotes most of the book to showing how much information a historical archaeologist can supply about the lives of enslaved and, later, free blacks at Mount Clare. There is more information about the free blacks than the enslaved. For example, among the freed is a prominent nineteenth-century preacher, Henry Harden, who was instrumental in the early days of the African Methodist Episcopal Church. Paralleling other attempts at representing and giving voice to the disenfranchised, in order to add speculative flesh to the traces of lived life revealed by the archaeological explorations of the enslaved's living quarters, Moyer uses what is known about other enslaved people at other plantations; and also examines the critical remarks the enslavers wrote about those they enslaved; the architecture of the manor house; the bills of sale and lists of residents. Among the themes she emphasizes are cultural continuity and political resistance. Thus bone beads found at a dig on the site allow Moyer to delineate how glass beads were important to Africans not only as adornment, but also 'to protect and empower the wearer'. She speculates that because these beads are bone rather than glass it shows that 'the material of the bead is less important than the cultural practices', which were 'too significant to abandon' (p. 59). Similarly, she uses a description of the dapper clothing that a runaway named Jack Lynch wore to opine that clothing, 'when used to express personal style, provided freedom within racism and from one's subordinate position' (p. 101).

Much of what Moyer argues will be familiar to scholars interested in antebellum slavery. Also familiar to those who study antebellum heritage sites are her arguments for what to do to promote social justice. Among these we are urged to give African Americans such as Harden space alongside their erstwhile enslavers, while also reminding visitors of the suffering of those dozens of the less visible enslaved, who once did the work that made life luxurious for whites while crafting ways to live lives of dignity despite the limited freedom granted them by the institution of slavery. These shifts, one imagines, will eventually come to pass at Mount Clare. Perhaps then those African Americans who use the park will visit the museum. Then again it seems far less likely that the Colonial Dames will call their ancestors

'enslavers', or come to see Mount Clare's luxurious furnishings, which they would like to emulate, as evidence of an essential immorality.

ERIC GABLE *University of Mary Washington*

Modern/ity's subjects

BILLAUD, JULIE. *Kabul carnival: gender politics in postwar Afghanistan*. viii, 244 pp., illus., bibliogr. Philadelphia: Univ. of Pennsylvania Press, 2015. £47.00 (cloth)

Recent work on Afghanistan is generally doubly centred: either presenting a rescue narrative whereby women are to be saved from their culture and/or Islam, or alternatively a historical analysis of the factors that helped produce continuous war in the country. While *Kabul carnival* does foreground its analysis in history, Julie Billaud does not take up the rescue narrative. Instead, drawing upon Bakhtin's notion of carnival, she speaks of a post-war Afghanistan, one in which the ready-made truths of modernity and development were put to the test in 1992 when the communist regime of Mohammad Nagibullah collapsed. As 'modernity' and 'development' are resurrected during post-war reconstruction, the analogy to carnival allows us to think about a society where disorder reigns supreme, where the line between licit and illicit is blurred, and where rules are imposed, suspended, and turned upside down.

Despite the historical complexities which influence religion and tradition in the region, international development organizations, the occupying forces, as well as state and many non-state actors view Afghan culture and women's role in it in essentialist terms. Whilst the social situation deteriorates, notions of authenticity that are particularly destructive to women's agency serve to stabilize the nation. Nation-building programmes, which attempt to move Afghans towards modernity, largely ignore local traditions and modes of knowledge while frequently lacking credibility among locals. Gender justice provides an illustration. The universal framework of freedom and rights does not always work for women, who, although they have been given equal rights under the Afghan constitution, find that the state is unable or unwilling to implement them. For example, women who flee family violence find that when they turn to the state for safety they are accused of the crime of 'running away from home' and are sent to prison. As the state fails to implement its own laws, women look for justice at the

intersection of legal institutions modelled on Western norms and the socially acknowledged sites of authority that are *shura* (lit. consultation) councils. Thus lawyers fighting for women's rights strategize by inviting local elders and regional leaders into the process. These individuals have moral authority in the community and often are able to ensure that decisions taken in law courts are implemented. Yet this community-based dispute resolution is often misogynist; to mitigate this bias, many lawyers have turned to Shari'a, which in Afghanistan is a patriarchal interpretation of the Qur'an, yet also provides women with religiously sanctioned rights that are largely missing from local cultural codes. For example, a daughter can draw upon Shari'a to challenge a parent who wants to deny her an education or marry her against her will.

Against this background, Billaud brings to life the narratives of the women she interviewed in the National Women's Dormitory in Kabul. Despite a desire to regulate daughters, sending them to school in Kabul appeals to some parents as it provides income opportunities. While studying at the university, many young women also work part-time at non-governmental organizations, supplementing the salaries of male family members. Funded by donors interested in furthering women's education, the dormitory where Billaud met many of her respondents has electricity, hot showers, and computers. Yet it is largely empty because families do not trust the state or the university authorities to protect their women from danger.

Interestingly, the posters in the dorms indicate the multiple imaginaries of carnival and play: in the hallways, American suffragettes invite women to feminist activism, while the posters inside individuals' rooms feature beautifully coiffed Hollywood and Bollywood stars, suggesting that the young women desire to become not feminist activists, but capitalist consumers. Films and social media play an important role in informing women of the latest music and fashion trends, while the various forms of veiling women practise express a form of social cohesion in a period of great disorder.

The nationalist discourse, Billaud notes, connects women's liberation to national emancipation, while national autonomy is connected to gender agency. In a carnivalesque appropriation of nationalist discourse, women negotiate both tradition and modernity. In the process, they challenge both family and state control of their bodies, as well as the universal framework for rights and its connection to foreign military and donor agencies. They consider

themselves modern women, but their modernity is not solely aligned with liberal feminist calls for secularity, but also is one that allows them to demand rights as legitimized through multiple sources, including the sacred as well as the capitalist realm. As such, these young women seek to enlarge, albeit slowly, the narrow space which is contemporary Afghanistan.

SHAHNAZ KHAN *Wilfrid Laurier University*

GRILLO, RALPH. *Muslim families, politics and the law: a legal industry in multicultural Britain*. xvi, 337 pp., figs, tables, bibliogr. Farnham, Surrey: Ashgate, 2015. £78.99 (cloth)

For anthropologists who study the intimate relations of Muslims in Britain – their marriages, conflictual relations and divorces, childrearing practices, and so on – it has long been clear that our research is located within wider UK public debates on multiculturalism, Islamophobia, honour killings, forced marriages, and so-called 'gender oppression'. At times, we have contributed to those debates from our own, necessarily restricted, perspectives. This immensely impressive book, by the anthropologist Ralph Grillo, reflects on the entire field of debate within Britain. It engages not only with anthropologists and other academics, but also with policy-makers and civil society actors; among whom are Asian and Muslim women, non-governmental organization activists dealing with gender-based violence, politicians, feminists, spokespeople, the police, Members of Parliament, the courts, health and educational officers, and the media. In this fraught, highly politicized field, encompassing political parties, moral lobbies, and the Houses of Parliament, Grillo manages to strike a balanced, nuanced, and scholarly tone, which enables us to understand the viewpoint of social actors from the right, left, and centre of the political spectrum, including those who invoke human rights, cultural relativism, political correctness, religious freedom, and community cohesion in order to back arguments for or against restrictive legislation. The book begins with an outline of this field of contentious politics, which Grillo labels the Muslim 'legal industry' – a term referencing other 'industries', such as those of race relations or development, that are similarly typified by a wide range of commentators and actors, many of whom are subsidized either directly or indirectly by the state.

One of the volume's best discussions is on forced marriages, beginning in chapter 4, which outlines the debate on whether or not to

criminalize persons, mainly family members, who perpetrate such marriages, often involving underage girls. Grillo draws on a wide range of sources, many of them accessed on-line, as he traces how the debate ended in the criminalization of those involved in forcing women to marry. He reports on conferences and parliamentary hearings, demonstrating how issues of culture, such as family 'honour' and thus also multiculturalism, transnationalism, and religious values, were important in the debate. The recent horrific murder of a young woman from Bradford, widely reported, who divorced her cousin to marry a Shia man, and whose father lured her to Pakistan on the pretence that he was ill, has once again underlined the complex values underpinning transnational arranged intra-familial marriages that go wrong. The case ended with the arrests of the father and ex-husband in Pakistan and the mother in the United Kingdom; and led to the implementation of more stringent laws in Pakistan, which previously had allowed 'victim' families (who in fact collude in honour killings) to settle such murders with 'compensation'. Such crimes also highlight the discrepancy in the values of first- and second-generation migrants.

Much of the book considers the single case study of whether or not to allow Shari'a councils to function in the United Kingdom. The number of these has increased and they are consulted mostly by women seeking a religious divorce in addition to, or in the absence of, a civil marriage. The book traces in some depth the different actors involved in this dispute through a discussion of a private member's bill which was brought by Baroness Cox to the House of Lords. The bill went to a second reading, but ultimately it has been dropped on the grounds that UK law already covers such councils. The fearmongering surrounding Shari'a law – popularly associated with stoning, hand amputations, polygamy, and gender discrimination – is frequently found in Britain. However, Shari'a tribunals are clearly only involved in civil and not criminal cases of mediation, are entered into voluntarily by both parties, and operate within the wider framework of UK law. British courts cannot grant Muslim religious divorces, thus Shari'a councils fulfil an essential role, particularly for Muslim women, as Kaveri Qureshi demonstrates in her recent book *Marital breakdown among British Asians* (2016). Grillo discusses this contentious issue with sensitivity, and a subtle attention to detail. Throughout this outstanding volume he draws on research by writers such as Charsley, Shaw, Ballard, Bowen, Cesari, and even

myself – anthropologists who have analysed the field of family law and multiculturalism as a 'negotiated order'. Providing readers with a veritable encyclopaedia of works on the subject, this book also has excellent chapters on Islamophobia and intercultural dialogue. As such, it is essential reading for anyone embarking on the study of Muslims in Britain.

PNINA WEBBER *Keele University*

HOESTEREY, JAMES BOURK. *Rebranding Islam: piety, prosperity, and a self-help guru*. xxvii, 262 pp., map, illus., bibliogr. Stanford: Univ. Press, 2016. \$21.95 (paper)

The transformations of religious traditions in our contemporary neoliberal age, in particular the new interactions between piety and aspirations for prosperity, have garnered wide interest within the study of religion. Scholars of Islam, too, have become attentive to corresponding developments within Muslim societies. James Bourk Hoesterey's *Rebranding Islam* is part of this trend and offers a fascinating journey into the life and (mis)fortunes of Aa Gym, an Indonesian Muslim televangelist who, in the first decade of the twenty-first century, became the new face of an Indonesian Islamic middle class that aspired to material and spiritual success.

Aa Gym emerged within the socioeconomic and political context of a post-authoritarian Indonesia, thoroughly transformed by IMF-imposed structural reforms and marked by vast hope for democratization. A motivational speaker and self-help guru whose corporate training seminars were trademarked under the title *Manajemen Qolbu* (management of the heart), Aa Gym succeeded in building a substantive following, becoming a national celebrity with significant social influence.

While derided by some as the 'Britney Spears of Islam' (p. 43) because of his television celebrity and for his lack of classical theological training, Aa Gym nonetheless succeeded in gaining authority through both his 'public image as the embodiment of Islamic virtue and entrepreneurial success' (p. 51) and his capacity 'to blend Sufi ideas of the heart with Western pop-psychology and corporate models of human resources training' (p. 3). Equipped with these tools, he offered his devotees practical 'how-to' techniques for applying Islamic teachings to everyday life.

In neoliberal Indonesia, Aa Gym's authority was further strengthened by his devotees' 'consumption practices and purchasing power' (p. 69). Since his followers listened to his

sermons, bought his books and photographs, attended (expensive) training seminars, and undertook pilgrimages to his headquarters, they 'were also always his market' (p. 51). Interestingly, as Hoesterey discusses in chapter 1, the majority of his devotees were women who saw him as personifying modern Indonesian ideals of Muslim masculinity: 'gentle, romantic, and emotionally communicative' (p. 57).

As a televangelist who represented a brand, his success depended heavily on his embodiment of the applicable ethical know-how he preached, and it was his perceived inability to do so that ultimately caused his fall from grace. For the ethnographer, Aa Gym's misfortune was fortuitous, as it allowed him to witness and observe not merely the thriving success but also the intriguing moment of the brand's collapse. Chapter 6 is dedicated entirely to analysing this fall, his devotees' reactions, the crumbling of a corporation, as well as Aa Gym's personal, ethical, and economic struggles following this calamity.

Hoesterey's approach in this book is not just reduced to showing how neoliberal models of the self-enterprising subject emphasizing capital accumulation affect Islamic traditions. Rather, he finely examines how Muslim practitioners establish resonances between 'neoliberal techniques of the self and Islamic modes of subjectivity' (p. 22), and how these techniques and psy-discourses are transformed by Islamic concepts of ethics and economy. He situates Aa Gym's preaching within newer expressions of public piety, adding a fresh dimension to the flourishing body of research on Muslim piety within global Islamic revival movements. Throughout the chapters which discuss Aa Gym's and *Manajemen Qolbu's* Islamic pop-psychology discourses with their economic visions and ethics linking economic activities intrinsically with civic duty, voluntarism, and ideas of developing the state, Hoesterey subtly exposes how these modern Muslim activists promote the idea of an enterprising subject who possesses self-initiative, yet is not autonomous, because he or she is profoundly God-reliant. Indonesian Muslim discourses of self-initiative do not fully conform with the idea of an unencumbered individual whose efforts alone guarantee success, nor is capital accumulation only for the self in this world, but is a preparation for life in the hereafter through charitable acts. Thus, Hoesterey argues that the logic of self-enterprise is transformed by Islamic idioms of fortune, charity, and moral obligation and, furthermore, is reinscribed into a vision of national commitment and duty.

At times I would have wished to have read more about the (ontological) tensions that might emerge in the apparently seamless process of interlacing pre-modern Islamic traditions of the self-cultivation with modern Western psychological understandings of the self as they are rearticulated within a neoliberal rationale. Nonetheless, the book provides important and fascinating insights into the complex ways Muslim practitioners in a particular local and historical context use globalizing discourses as a lens through which their own religious traditions are being reread, and vice versa. Eventually, religious traditions, as well as globalizing discourses, are transformed according to local plausibility.

JEANETTE S. JOUILI *University of Pittsburgh*

JEFFREYS, ELAINE with HAIQING YU. *Sex in China*. xi, 232 pp., map, illus., tables, bibliogr. Cambridge: Polity, 2015. £15.99 (paper)

China's recent 'sexual revolution' is widely explained as the effect of liberalizing influences associated with China's 'opening up' to the West. Many good scholarly works in both English and Chinese critique this view, but *Sex in China* is the first that offers a comprehensive critical overview of the meanings, representations, and processes of this phenomenon; seeing it not as a product of Westernization, but as the dynamic instantiation of the interaction between historical, cultural, local, and global forces in China's contemporary market environment.

Based on a survey of changing policies, media and on-line discussions, and academic research, the book is structured around key themes: marriage and family planning; youth behaviours; LGBT issues; commercialized sex; health; and sexuality studies in China. Throughout, the authors critique the familiar dichotomy between the repressive state and a potentially subversive civil society, which is still widely, although erroneously, applied to state-society relations in China. By the same token, the book's exploration of the newly emerging spaces of articulation of diverse sexualities does not argue that these are inherently empowering for the groups and individuals involved, nor that they feed into conceptualizations of the individual self that mirror Western ideas and practices.

After a clearly written and helpful introduction, chapter 2 focuses on the linked issues of marriage, family, and reproduction. With vignettes illustrating the changing character of marriage, the chapter demonstrates how, despite the increasing incidence of divorce, pre- and

extra-marital sex, and same-sex self-identification, heterosexual marriage remains an almost universal experience in China, boosted as much by cultural expectations and material constraints (including housing difficulties) as by regulatory requirements. It also argues that despite the widely noted emergence of the emotionally expressive individual in contemporary Chinese society, marriage and reproduction – albeit in reconfigured forms – remain a family and social matter as much as an individual arrangement.

Chapter 3, on 'Youth and sex(iness)', and chapter 4, on the emerging LGBT culture, discuss the sexualization of public youth culture, not as the expression of subversion or rebellion against a conservative establishment, but as 'a search for new sexual subjectivities and more inclusive forms of citizenship' (p. 66) in a world in which sex is increasingly commercialized and mediatized. They argue that across sites such as androgynous and cross-dressing performances in TV talent shows, and the writings of female sex bloggers, young women and men are celebrating their sexual identities and explorations within parameters that do not challenge dominant gender arrangements. Gay men and lesbian women, for example, commonly make decisions to enter into 'co-operative marriages' in order to accommodate family and social pressure by appearing to conform to heteronormative expectations.

Chapter 5 examines the re-emergence of commercialized sex three decades after the government claimed it had been eradicated. It argues that the legacy of government attempts to abolish prostitution is a fraught one. The government remains committed to eradicating prostitution at the same time as it tolerates public debate led by prominent sociologists and activists about the legalization and decriminalization of the sex industry. Tentative government moves to support more lenient treatment of sex workers emerge alongside continued police-led crackdowns against prostitution.

Chapter 6 surveys the spread of HIV/AIDS in China, covering the changing HIV demography and shifts in government response: from initial reluctance to acknowledging the disease's extent, to targeting high-risk sectors and adopting a 100 per cent condom-use programme. Here also there is a tension between the government's increasing awareness of the need to formulate an effective strategy to control the spread of the disease and reduce the stigma associated with it, and the effects of its strategy in re-entrenching established social hierarchies. Education campaigns to raise awareness about high-risk

categories overwhelmingly focus on already-disadvantaged sectors – the poor, rural migrants, gay men, and prostitutes – while exempting from attention high-status corporate elites and government officials. Furthermore, leaving HIV education to operate through market mechanisms and individual responsibilities rather than state controls can only contribute to exacerbating such differentials.

If the book's focus on China's new sexualities obscures the extent of cultural and institutional resistance to this 'sexual revolution', the analysis it contains also calls attention to the limits of the revolution: regardless of its emancipatory appeal to young urbanites, it also contributes to reasserting familiar class-based hierarchies, according to which the young/cosmopolitan/wealthy/urban intersection signals progress and freedom, while the uneducated and disadvantaged rural migrants implicitly are held responsible for spreading disease and disrupting social order. The book is thus a rich resource for students and researchers interested in the changing contours of social and cultural life in China.

HARRIET EVANS *University of Westminster*

WOOD, DONALD C. *Ogata-mura: sowing dissent and reclaiming identity in a Japanese farming village*. xiv, 247 pp., maps, tabs, figs, illus., bibliogr. Oxford, New York: Berghahn Books, 2012. £75.00 (cloth)

Based on seventeen years' participant observation, *Ogata-mura* traces in thick ethnographic detail a complete political and social history of a centrally planned farming community in north-eastern Japan. Built on reclaimed land, Ogata-mura was conceived in the immediate post-war period as a means of alleviating an anticipated national food shortfall and promised to be a model of modern, efficient agriculture. Volunteer farmers from all over Japan, settling in five waves from 1965 to 1978, agreed to purchase 10-hectare plots of virgin land (unusually large for Japan) and farm them collectively, using cutting-edge equipment and techniques. Wood's forty-year history shows how this group of intrepid farmers first built and then contested this invented community.

Wood critiques both the original planners of Ogata-mura and economists for ignoring the fact 'that economy is always social' (p. 244), while crafting a sensitive portrait of the human dramas that animate its economic history. The settlers managed to construct 'close, kinlike ties' (p. 21)

to replace the 'deeply rooted relations' (p. 72) which they abandoned when they relocated. Although the ideal of labouring jointly vanished quickly, the co-operative farming groups – usually comprising five or six men from the same region – nevertheless proved to be the settlers' first essential social structure, becoming for many 'closer than family' (p. 76). The settlers' wives, joining later, found more welcome in the *jūku*, a block of households in the residential centre of the community united by residence rather than employment, and which have since proved to be the more enduring form of social organization.

As these new communities began to form, they divided into factions that continue to define the community's fault-lines. When the 1970s national rice surplus led Tokyo to mandate that farmers restrict their output, villagers divided over their response. Feeling that they had been lured to Ogata-mura under false pretences, the dissenting faction (*yatō*) devised a number of measures both to circumvent acreage restrictions and to sell their produce on the black market. The majority who complied (*yorō*) argued that defiance would only hasten the demise of small-scale rice growing, resenting the dissidents both for successfully pursuing an illegal advantage and for damaging the community's reputation. This latter faction retained control of the village government for twenty years via Mayor Miyata Seiki (1978–2000), who sponsored a number of questionably successful PR initiatives aimed at revitalizing the town. The 2000 election, which gave the minority faction control of the mayor's office, and the 2008 and 2012 elections which sustained it, periodically revived these factional tensions in the face of changing circumstances.

Although Ogata-mura is far from typical, it should be of great interest to students of Japan precisely because it shows what happens to Japanese attitudes, norms, and institutions when they are uprooted and introduced into a vacuum. The settlers' early rejection of co-operative farming, too, is an instructive rebuttal of any illusions about Japanese collectivism. The volume should also interest scholars working in transitional economies where central planning is giving way to free markets; and those interested in global economic development more broadly. Wood provides a case study in the vicissitudes of negotiating between 'nature' and 'culture' in a community that can be described as an 'experiment in "high modernism"' (p. 219).

However, Wood misses the opportunity to address the settlers' sense that Ogata-mura has never truly become *furusato* (lit. 'hometown', but also an idyllic, rural, and intimately familiar place)

by saying little about its shrines and temples (pp. 58–64). While some Japanese *kami* (deities or spirits) are of national importance and renown, the vast majority are bound to particular localities, and function as metaphorical representations of the community itself. Perhaps, having been selected for their willingness to embrace modernity, the settlers may have overlooked the importance of establishing in their new home the rich cultural apparatus which elsewhere is chiefly responsible for the feeling of sympathy between a community and its territory.

Wood concludes by situating Ogata-mura within a broader discussion of Japanese rice growing's future, with particular reference to the Trans-Pacific Partnership (TPP), which threatens to undercut the domestic rice market with cheap imports. TPP is a symptom of a global economy that has lately been accused of undermining modes of production that are closely tied to certain cultural identities, from American blue-collar manufacturing to Japanese rice farmers who 'live to farm', as one settler put it, rather than 'farming to live'. I eagerly await the next chapter in this community's ongoing saga.

BENJAMIN D. COX *University of Texas at Austin*

WORONOV, T.E. *Class work: vocational schools and China's urban youth*. viii, 185 pp., fig., bibliogr. Stanford: Univ. Press, 2015. £21.99 (paper)

Class work is an ambitious book that aims to analyse class formation in China through the lens of vocational schools and their students. In her introduction, Woronov points to the lack of interest in vocational education in the otherwise vivid debates about the competitive Chinese education system and its hard-working students. Even within China, few seem to be aware of the fact that educational policies are formulated in such a way that, after nine years of compulsory schooling, nearly half of the country's youth fail to pass the examination to enter mainstream high schools. Yet, despite the fact that those who enter vocational schools do so for 'complicated' reasons, the dominant perception of such students is that they have failed, both literally and metaphorically. At the age of 16, they have already failed the crucial exam that might have opened doors to a white-collar future. Moreover, Woronov argues, they have metaphorically failed because in China exam results are implicitly equated to a person's moral value. Woronov's project is at least two-fold: she critically examines the stereotypes of vocational education students through meticulous fieldwork undertaken in

urban vocational schools; and she uses her field data as a starting-point for exploring competing regimes of value and the emergence of a new service-sector class in urban China.

Chapter 1 provides a useful overview of the general development of vocational education in China with an emphasis on the reform era from 1978. The chapter also outlines the history of the two vocational schools in Nanjing city that served as the author's field-sites for one year. One school was a remnant of a socialist state-owned worker training school, meaning that it was not even part of the educational bureaucracy. The other school was entirely based on capitalist logic, selling an educational product to students who then had to find jobs on their own upon graduation.

The following chapters take the reader through an engaging and illuminating story of what it is like to be a student in an urban vocational school and reveal how the structure of vocational education prepares these youth to become members of a new urban working class. While the Chinese government has invested in vocational education and promotes it as an attractive road into becoming part of a modern knowledge economy, in reality, as Woronov shows, the structure and practice of urban vocational education channel youth, who come from a variety of working-class backgrounds, into a new urban precariat.

Woronov describes a complex group of individuals who reflect on their options for social mobility and their prospects for the future. Some students could have entered regular academic high schools but deliberately chose a safer road to a secure urban income in order to save their parents any future tuition fees. Others who failed the high school entrance exam could not afford private schooling and therefore had no alternative but to enter vocational education. Clearly, students and parents make strategic educational choices based on their strained and uncertain economic situations. This helps to explain why there were no students in the two schools who belonged to the urban middle class.

Students thus entered the schools as youths from working-class backgrounds and during their education acquired a number of skills which equipped them for a realistic future as urban workers in the low-end service sector. Woronov poignantly describes how students slept through classes, did irrelevant practical work, and graduated with low marks. Even these were important lessons, because through these 'practical' experiences students acquired some of the skills needed in their future jobs, such as how to be flexible workers, to be able to work shifts, to

tolerate boredom, and to accept unpredictable authority. Despite this experience, graduates from vocational schools remain vulnerable in the Chinese urban labour market. In the final chapter, the author traces former students from her field-sites in order to learn how they fared in the labour market. Like many other graduates from vocational schools, they had successfully entered the rapidly growing tertiary sector. However, what optimistic statistics do not show is how these graduates, through their vocational education, have in effect become part of a new urban working class.

Class work is an ethnography of vocational education and an anthropology of class formation. It offers an entirely new analytical perspective on the structure and practice of vocational education in China and provokes stimulating theoretical reflections on the making of social hierarchy and class after Mao. It is an excellent piece of scholarship that deserves a broad readership of students and researchers from different academic disciplines.

METTE HALSKOV HANSEN *University of Oslo*

Performance, narrative, and identity

COVINGTON-WARD, YOLANDA. *Gesture and power: religion, nationalism, and everyday performance in Congo*. 287 pp., maps, illus., bibliogr. Durham, N.C.: Duke Univ. Press, 2016. £21.99 (paper)

From the first Portuguese arrival in 1492, to King Leopold II of Belgium's Congo Free State, and later still to Mobutu Sese Seko's repressive regime, the Kongo people's gestures, dances, and religious rituals have symbolized individual and collective tactics, collective actions, as well as ideas that shaped claims of spiritual and political authority, autonomy, and national identity. Enacted with heightened awareness, consciousness, and/or intention, for centuries these movements have encouraged religious and political claims that either challenged or supported existing power structures. The Kongo people's weapons have been *bimpampa* (gestures), *zakama* (spirit-induced trembling), *maniku* (dances), and other actions, such as handshaking, clapping, and bowing, that are rooted in the Lower Congo region's culture and history.

Covington-Ward situates her sophisticated theoretical analysis at the intersection between

anthropological theories of embodiment, performance, and history. She focuses on 'the everyday interactions that create ruptures and challenges in struggles for power and authority placing the body at the center' (p. 8). The result is a neologism, 'performative encounters', that 'describe[s] situations when the body is used strategically in everyday life to transform interpersonal social relationships in meaningful ways, impacting the social and political positions of the people interacting' (p. 15).

The encounters Covington-Ward analyses in the book are the result of her solid research in various missionary and national archives. By focusing on performance and the body as the centre of analysis, the conduit of subjectivity and identity, and the catalyst of social transformations, she examines the politics of the micro-interactions between missionaries, colonial officers, and the Kongo people. Some examples include the 1701 encounter between a Catholic priest and King Pedro IV, ruler of the Kongo; and the historical moment when the prophet Simon Kimbangu, founder of the Kimbanguist or Kinguza movement in 1921, met Léon-Georges Morel, the Belgian Congo's colonial administrator. Kimbangu and his followers surrounded Morel and performed a powerful *zakama*, thus preventing him from saying anything that would be audible.

These performances, which the Europeans defined as inappropriate, grotesque, crazy, uncontrolled, and hysterical, were the Kongo people's weapons in what Covington-Ward nicely terms 'a war being fought not by guns but with music, prayer, and bodies' (p. 72). Kimbangu's spirit-induced trembling (*zakama*), which dated back to the pre-colonial era, was indeed a disturbing performance for the colonizers, who saw it as a politically subversive act against the European colonial regime, which, after all, also included the control of not only the land and resources, but also the bodies and gestures of the Kongo people.

By engaging with Achille Mbembe's work on the banality of power, Covington-Ward shows how dance and performance are part of the minute details of power that subtly penetrate everyday life. Through an attentive analysis of *animation politique* as a critical site of the intersection of civil religion, nationalism, and bodies (p. 164), she skilfully examines the gendered dimension of coerced performance. During the Mobutu regime, for example, women of the rural animation troupes were forced into a gendered citizenship through which they were expected to deify Mobutu, celebrate

'his' nation, and perform sexually for government officials.

The theoretical frame of the book and its main concepts are elegantly outlined in the introduction, while the author's overarching argument about the political role and power of performances, ritual gestures, and movements flows well throughout the four sections and wonderful case studies that follow. The outstanding contribution of this book is to provide a deep and certainly passionate study of religious practices outside structured ritual contexts, and of politics outside the conventional arenas and means of governance. It particularly examines and reveals the role of religion in colonial and postcolonial struggles for spiritual and political power and illuminates the unnoticed acts of subversion that take place in a tumultuous 'contact zone' where Europeans and African people meet and clash over the use of bodies.

Gesture and power is an extraordinary work useful for researchers and scholars in African studies, anthropology, and religious studies. Its chapters on methodology and gender offer valuable teaching material for courses on ethnographic research. The result is a significant work that provides serious and fertile historical and ethnographic material and offers a solid methodological format and an insightful perspective on African embodied politics and religious practices in both the past and the present.

ANNALISA BUTTICCI *Utrecht University*

GAY, ROBERT. *Bruno: conversations with a Brazilian drug dealer*. ix, 222 pp., illus., bibliogr. Durham, N.C.: Duke Univ. Press, 2015. £16.99 (paper)

Robert Gay has written an intimate, eye-opening book that opens a window into the politics of prisons and drug prohibition in Brazil. Based on fourteen months of interviews, all with a single informant named Bruno, this book positively vibrates with opportunities to draw connections and make conclusions. While the sociological specificity of *Bruno* operates on a relatively small scale and amid a decidedly unique context, Gay's conversations with this Brazilian drug dealer also animate the dynamics that drive social relationships well beyond Brazil. *Bruno's* success as sociological reportage also invites anthropological conversations about the politics of testimony as literary genre, especially given the differences between Bruno and *Bruno*. First the book.

The short story is that Bruno was born poor, and he joined the navy in hopes of a better life. While stationed on Brazil's border with Bolivia, he became involved with the country's growing cocaine economy, ultimately moving the drug to Rio de Janeiro's favelas every month. Bruno subsequently made money, invested in real estate, and sought the good life. His eventual arrest connected him to the Rio-based Comando Vermelho (CV) crime syndicate, which ultimately shaped his eight years inside prison, with Bruno ultimately taking on a position of leadership in the organization. His relative success involved manhandling prisoners while also manipulating prison authorities; Bruno also used deadly force to improve prison conditions. This is a complicated narrative that reveals both the brutality and necessity of men such as Bruno, who keep the peace inside of prisons while also making sure that prisoners get such basic necessities as food and clothes. In this sense, *Bruno* is as much a portrayal of the different scales of sovereignty as it is about the prison industrial complex.

The story of Bruno stands on its own as an immediate contribution to the social-scientific study of gangs, drugs, and prisons in Latin America. No one knows enough about these worlds to ignore this book. Read it cover to cover. Yet *Bruno* as an experiment in ethnographic writing is also a reason to pick up this volume – because there is a complicated tension here between Bruno and *Bruno*. At its most basic, *Bruno* is Gay's book about Bruno, but the way in which Gay has written Bruno as *Bruno* suggests that this book and the man are one and the same: the ethnography is presented almost entirely in the form of a transcript. Edited for length and style, the vast majority of *Bruno* presents Bruno's extended answers in the form of block quotations. The author is obviously riding the last remaining waves of *testimonio*, a tradition in Latin America that prioritizes first-person accounts of those who otherwise do not have a voice.

However, the effect of this form raises questions about the necessity of narrative. Gay, in his postscript, makes a not so subtle case for a one-to-one relationship between *Bruno* and Bruno. In one of the only narratively driven sections of the book, Bruno guides Gay through some of his old haunts and the anthropologist seems relieved: '[I]t was clear to me that Bruno was every bit a man of his word, and that if I ever had any doubts about the veracity of his testimony, they were completely unfounded' (pp. 197-8).

There is no need to rehearse long-standing debates about *testimonio*, which Gay does

acknowledge (p. 4). The truth or falsity of Bruno's answers or the accuracy of Gay's transcriptions interest me far less as an anthropologist than the importance of narrative to ethnographic analysis. Take a productive contrast between *Bruno* and, say, João Biehl's *Vita* (2005), which is also an ethnography about drugs, imprisonment, and a single Brazilian. However, Biehl goes to great lengths to bring his informant's social worlds to life with affected prose and stylized images. To place these two books side by side, not simply on a shelf but also on a syllabus, is to pose the following question: what is lost or gained by stripping down a single life to block quotes? My sense, though I am keen to explore this tension in both graduate and undergraduate classes, is that Gay's stripped-down approach produces the look of ethnographic *verité*, but ultimately sidesteps the ethnographer's responsibility to present the reader with a robust interpretation of social relationships in all their complexity.

KEVIN LEWIS O'NEILL *University of Toronto*

KOSKOFF, ELLEN. *A feminist ethnomusicology: writings on music and gender*. xvi, 237 pp., tables, figs, bibliogr. Urbana: Univ. of Illinois Press, 2014. £27.99 (paper)

A scholarly book rarely satisfies the academic reviewer fully, as one publication scarcely can cover all relevant ground in its field(s) of research. Ellen Koskoff's *A feminist ethnomusicology* is an inspiring exception: I strongly encourage scholars and students interested in music, anthropology, gender, and feminist scholarship to read it. Organized chronologically in three parts that cover four decades of passionate field research and changing conceptual directions, this 'intellectual memoir' (p. 1) provides rich insights about women and music in cross-cultural perspectives, which was the theme of a ground-breaking volume Koskoff edited in 1987. Throughout the personal reflections on crucial turning-points for her thinking about gender and power, culture and nature, the symbolic and real, performativity and embodiment, feminist epistemology and methodology in human musical interactions, Koskoff also builds a convincing argument about the fundamental value of ethnographic fieldwork for gathering primary data; an argument that becomes a sophisticated critique of more recent directions taken in gender and cultural studies.

Seven of the thirteen chapters have been previously published and Koskoff introduces each of the three parts by discussing the main themes

in feminism, anthropology, and ethnomusicology that influenced her during the period. The first part and period (1976-90) begins with an outline of the development from women to gender studies in anthropology and ethnomusicology. It is followed by a reprint of Koskoff's introduction to the above-mentioned 1987 volume *Women and music in cross-cultural perspective*, and a 1990 article comparing three case studies of women's roles in ritual life. These chapters provide an excellent overview of the key scholarly debates about gender in the 1970s and 1980s and how they were applied in research of gender, power, and musical behaviour in non-Western settings.

The second part/period (1990-2000) begins with an anecdote about a woman severing her husband's penis in revenge for years of abuse. It is used to highlight the ambivalence felt by feminist scholars in relation to oppression, empowerment, and (Western) privilege that underpinned the 'third wave' of postmodern feminism and feminist theory. The call for more self-reflexive ethnographic research as well as the representation of informants' and the researcher's positionality as situated knowledge shaped a new feminist ethnomusicology, but also produced new fault-lines between theoretically informed feminist scholars and those committed to anthropological understandings based on 'intersubjective fieldwork' (p. 72). The remaining five chapters in this part show how Koskoff worked through these conceptual shifts by strengthening her commitment to collecting detailed ethnographic data for fine-grained analyses of gendered power relations in a diversity of musical and performance traditions. Her long-standing research among Hasidic Jews forms the basis of many of her discussions in this and other parts of the book.

Part three covers 2000-12 and begins with Koskoff's growing frustrations with the marginalization of feminist research in mainstream ethnomusicology and the waning of feminist consciousness amongst new generations of students. After discussing the emerging themes of performativity and embodiment in feminist anthropology and ethnomusicology in the section's introductory chapter, the next chapter, 'The ins and outs on in and out' (p. 157), examines the analytical categories of emic and etic, which she argues limit new insights in feminist ethnomusicology. She presents the emic-etic, or inside-outside, model as a prototype for other binary oppositions and the associated privileging of one over the other. Koskoff identifies five related assumptions about difference as especially limiting for feminist anthropology and ethnomusicology, persistent

ideas about the undifferentiated, fixed, stable, bounded, and opposed cultural and social categories. She develops this argument in the final chapter through an imagined conversation with her former selves and her readers about assumptions of difference and sameness, and how they are intrinsically interconnected in people's everyday lives. This returns her to the book's main argument about the essential role of intersubjective fieldwork for the feminist ethnomusicology she promotes, because: 'It is difficult to truly objectify a person with whom you have shared a part of your life, with whom you have performed music, or to whom you have told secrets' (p. 186). This seemingly self-explanatory statement, as this enjoyable book makes clear, has complex consequences for how, where, and why we do research, as well as for the broader relevance of our analysis. To our students it should be obligatory to also point out, as Koskoff does, that fieldwork is 'the most direct, immediate, and honest (as well as fun) way to learn about someone else and her or his music' (p. 186).

ÅSE OTTOSSON *University of Sydney*

KUNREUTHER, LAURA. *Voicing subjects: public intimacy and mediation in Kathmandu*. xv, 303 pp., illus., bibliogr. Berkeley: Univ. of California Press, 2014. £27.95 (paper)

Laura Kunreuther's *Voicing subjects* begins on the back of a Nepali friend's motorcycle in September 1989 just months before the first People's Movement (*jana andolan I*), which re-established a multi-party democracy in the country. As the author gets her first look at the city, she reflects on a conversation held earlier with her friend, who had explained that the country was at a critical juncture because the people wanted 'to be able to speak more freely' (p. 1). Speeding past the palace gates, Kunreuther comments that she understands the people's frustration with the King. She is surprised when her friend immediately stops in order to turn around and tell her that she should not speak about such things in public. In the days immediately following King Birendra's concession to a multi-party system on 9 April 1990, Kunreuther sees an abrupt change in this discourse on public speech, noting that her landlord (and others) frequently comment that 'finally, finally we can speak' (p. 3).

These early observations concerning what can be voiced when and under what circumstances frame Kunreuther's analysis of subjectivity in the years following the democracy movements in Nepal. Her analysis weaves together a discussion

of a political voice (associated with democratic participation and the ability to raise one's voice) with that of an intimate voice (related to personal interiority), arguing that the two are mutually constitutive. Her analysis builds on the work of Althusser to consider how distinct interpellative acts call a subject into being. Each of the chapters explores an instance of interpellation, such as the practice of brothers calling their married sisters back to their home of birth to visit; the ritual act of 'seeing face' (*mukh herne*); the emergence of FM radio as a symbol for transparency and democratic expression; the reading of heartfelt letters over the radio waves; and radio-transmitted telephone calls to family members living outside of Nepal. Kunreuther's ethnography demonstrates that voice is not only a marker of individual agency, but also a site of intersubjective production.

By making the 'figure of the voice' rather than radio (or another media technology) the focus of analysis, *Voicing subjects* offers a novel perspective on mediation. Listeners to FM radio programmes put into question the presumed distinction between mediated and unmediated communication, for example, when they suggest that the radio allows for a more direct communication than is possible in face-to-face encounters, which are mediated by cultural practices and social positions. Kunreuther's text considers the materiality of mediation not only through an attention to the difference in sound of FM radio (including its relative lack of static, which indexes a greater perceived transparency) in comparison to the state-produced AM radio, but also in the smoothness sought by a FM radio programme host, whose voice serves as a vehicle through which Nepali citizens gain access to a public who will listen to their concerns. Through both the telephone and the radio, the voices of the diaspora become present in Kathmandu, materializing the social relations between those in and outside of Nepal.

Throughout the book, Kunreuther avoids focusing on high-profile political events, instead exploring voiced subjectivity and the emergence of liberal politics during these years of intense sociopolitical change through the daily interaction of citizens and the state on occasions such as the debates over property reform and radio-supported attempts to engage with the diaspora. In her conclusion, however, she makes a compelling analytic and narrative choice by turning to the moment of dramatic media silence following the 2001 massacre of King Birendra and his immediate family. If the introduction of the book centres on an assertion (finally, finally we

can speak), the conclusion focuses instead on a question posed by the editor of Nepal's primary daily newspaper in response to this silence: 'Who could speak?'

Kunreuther uses this moment of silence to show us 'a profound tension felt by many between their position as national subjects of the King and their position as national citizens of a democratic state' (p. 244). The author reminds us here that political change is not a swift transition between two well-defined subject positions, but rather an ongoing reimagining of relations between citizens and the state. In so doing, she writes an insightful ethnography that will be of interest not only to students and scholars interested in media, subjectivity, and South Asia, but also those interested in political transitions and democratization processes.

JENNIFER ASHLEY *George Mason University*

OTTOSON, ÅSE. *Making Aboriginal men and music in central Australia*. 216 pp., maps, illus., bibliogr. London: Bloomsbury, 2016. £85.00 (cloth)

At the end of this ethnographic examination of popular music-making in Central Australia, Åse Ottosson notes that 'a great deal of . . . research in indigenous Australia continue [*sic*] to focus on continuities (i.e. traditions) and remote-living, non-urban (i.e. traditional oriented) people and practices' (p. 178) rather than on the '[p]opular, non-ancestral music activities [that] are ordinary, regular and ubiquitous phenomena of indigenous people's contemporary lives' (p. 179). Her ethnography puts to rest any notion that these cultural practices do not merit analysis because they are 'too mundane or too obvious' (p. 179). Indeed, Ottosson makes a compelling case that 'localized styles and fusions of country, rock and reggae music', which she identifies as 'the preferred non-ancestral music genres in this highly diverse regional Aboriginal music scene', have 'become core expressive forms in Aboriginal life worlds' (p. 35).

As a white Swedish woman, Ottosson seems an unlikely candidate to conduct research into Aboriginal popular music's 'largely male homosocial world' (p. xii); the discussion of her positionality in the preface is a model of ethnographic reflexivity. As her narrative progresses, we come to admire the many insights her 'unconventional' position (p. xvii) facilitated over fifteen months' fieldwork. She follows male Aboriginal musicians in 'four different settings – an Aboriginal recording studio, remote Aboriginal

communities, non-indigenous-dominated townships and on tours beyond the musicians' home region' (p. xiii), to examine how 'coherent senses of selves emerge from peoples' everyday practices and expressive forms' (p. 5).

The first two chapters provide background information, including pithy summaries of history; an account of Australian colonization to demonstrate how European/colonial and Aboriginal models of manhood coexist; thumbnail biographies of some pioneering Aboriginal musicians; and theoretical issues such as change in Aboriginal terrains, music and identity, and masculinities. Chapters 3 and 4 concern the goings-on in the Central Australian Aboriginal Media Association (CAAMA) recording studio, where Ottosson worked. The studio is the crossroads of much Aboriginal musical activity, involving three different, but overlapping, groups of musicians: bush/community musicians, town musicians, and out-of-town musicians. Ottosson shows how the practices surrounding work schedules and the circulation of equipment echo traditional Aboriginal values; and how participants' negotiations between these values and more global notions of professionalism explore and assert masculine identities. The discussion includes a mapping of various musical styles and gestures.

The remaining chapters build on this detailed analysis of Aboriginal masculinities in order to explore music-making in wider contexts. Ottosson maps different musical genres to the different generations in Aboriginal ontologies to make sense of the structure of battle of the bands events that provide opportunities for different Aboriginal communities to interact. Aboriginal shows in non-Aboriginal towns, in which Aboriginal groups represent themselves not only to other Aboriginal groups, but to Australian whites as well, provide the opportunity to examine the ways in which Aboriginal musicians work with the stereotypes applied to them by outsiders, and the ways in which they parlay their experiences as Others in white communities to enhance their own masculine status at home. Ottosson's approach is 'intercultural mediation', which examines how 'a range of local and global forms of practice, imagery, values and ideas about being male, indigenous and musicians are connected and recombined in partial and incomplete ways' (p. xii). She integrates her approach with an Aboriginal appellation – 'mongrel' (a derogatory term 'appropriated and reinscribed' by indigenous people [p. xiv]) – to characterize local understandings of the practices she theorizes.

One chapter subtitle – 'between men' (p. 94) – led me to expect a reference to Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick's influential erotic triangles model from her 1985 book, *Between men*. Despite the absence of this important source, Ottosson provides a nuanced account of the contradictory values, beliefs, and behaviours among Aboriginal men. Given the keenness of the occasional musical descriptions, I was disappointed by the paucity of musical stylistic details; however, Ottosson makes clear that the book does not 'focus on musical detail or structure and will not analyze music in terms of a semiotic system' (p. 9). Throughout the book, I appreciated Ottosson's fifteen years as a journalist: her descriptions are vivid; the reportorial division of the book's chapters into short, easy-to-digest sections is friendly and inviting; and arguments are clearly stated and cogent. She paints a powerful portrait of Aboriginal men making music, providing a compelling analysis of how these musical activities quite literally 'make' Aboriginal masculinities. Ottosson makes a strong case for how country music activities produce 'distinctively indigenous experiences' that are 'profoundly meaningful and coherent' (p. 179). The result is a fascinating, multi-layered, readable, and convincing analysis.

HENRY SPILLER *University of California, Davis*

PERRY, MARC D. *Negro soy yo: hip hop and raced citizenship in neoliberal Cuba*. xi, 284 pp., illus., bibliogr. Durham, N.C.: Duke Univ. Press, 2016. £20.99 (paper)

Marc Perry's *Negro soy yo* offers a historical analysis of Cuban hip-hop as a site of racial performance in an emerging market economy that turned towards self-entrepreneurship at the onset of the country's Special Period. Perry describes the Cuban economic context during the time of his research (1998 to the mid-2000s) as characterized by declining state regulation, privatized market transitions, and the dollar's legalization. Cuba was a country divided between 'revolutionary decline' and a process of 'becoming' (p. 4). Perry identifies marginalization as an effect of what he terms 'raced neoliberalism' in Cuba, and focuses on hip-hop as an outcome of these conditions.

Since the nation experienced a mediated insertion into global capitalism, Perry's use of the term 'neoliberalism' seems more sensationalist than effective. Relying on Aihwa Ong's definition of neoliberalism (*Neoliberalism as exception*, 2006), Perry claims neoliberal policies or processes have entered Cuba as exceptions to the

socialist economic model. Commonly a term associated with *laissez-faire* economic liberalism, neoliberalism fails to adequately describe Cuba's unique embargoed post-communist economic context. Considering the work of other scholars who have addressed the phenomenon of Cuba's pseudo-neoliberal experiment, such as Antonio Carmona Baez (*State resistance to globalization in Cuba*, 2004) and Carlo Fanelli ('"Cubanalismo": the Cuban alternative to neoliberalism', *Journal of Marxism and Interdisciplinary Inquiry* 2: 1, 2008, 7-16), would have strengthened Perry's assertions.

Perry's methodology consists of participant observation, interviews, site visits, and informal discussions in which he explores 'the possibilities – and potential limitations – of "blackness" as a methodological framework' (p. 21). This method, explained as the practice and articulation of race between subjects and investigator, aims to provide a comparative, cross-national analysis that identifies routes of black internationalism between the United States and Cuba.

Perry's ethnography focuses on Cuban hip-hop as a key site for the performance and practice of race. The varied racial identifications experienced by Perry's interlocutors are told as personal stories and become the ethnography's core. Perry chooses to highlight Cuban rap duos Obsesión and Anónimo Consejo, whose lyrics effectively illustrate his argument as they are known for their Afro-centric repertoires. Afro-Cuban producers and promoters Pablo Herrera and Ariel Fernandez, offered as the protagonists of *Negro soy yo*, additionally personify Perry's structural analysis by representing two ends of a single spectrum: one independent, the other state affiliated, both intermediaries between Cuba's hip-hop movement and the state.

Perry reflects on the process of black subjectivity as a means towards 'self-fashioning' (p. 136), thus offering a vision of racial citizenship as assessed among the hip-hop practitioners who are prominent in the book. He identifies rappers' practice of racial self-identification as rooted in the claiming of black subjects both from Cuban national history and through Afro-centric stories of black radical struggle. Within this discussion, Perry also addresses some of the challenges faced by women within the *machista* or male-dominated spheres of racialized patriarchy.

Having established the racially distinct defiant voices of his ethnography, Perry proceeds to examine the interplay between the musical genre's leadership and the Cuban state. *Negro soy yo* offers a timeline of state efforts to incorporate

and mediate hip-hop within the institutional frameworks of the nation's revolutionary national culture. Perry summarizes these into three distinct phases: cautious tolerance, appropriation, and, finally, commercialization. In tandem with this overview, Perry identifies how various phases coincided with shifts in rap's performance spaces and the crafting of cosmopolitan black social spaces. The Cuban state's initial reaction in the early 1990s was to censor rap music selectively. Later, influenced by US-Cuban artist exchanges and the genre's legitimization by political intellectuals, rap was re-envisioned as the vanguard of the revolution. The culmination of this period was the establishment of the Cuban Rap Agency (ACR) in 2002, which placed rap as the centrifugal product of a self-financed state office. For Perry the latter exemplifies the height of the state's incorporative strategies over rappers. Although insightful for understanding the symbiotic relationship between state and society, Perry treats the Cuban government as a static monolithic entity rather than scrutinizing the complexities, tensions, and shifting opinions between state delegates, government offices, and differing institutional pursuits.

Although I would have liked Perry's ethnography to offer greater complexity and a multiracial assessment of hip-hop and economic marginality, *Negro soy yo* makes a distinguished contribution to the study of raced citizenship and the performance of blackness through the self-fashioning of Cuban hip-hop. It also is an interesting oral history set in Havana at the beginning of the millennium and in the midst of Cuba's recent economic transitions.

MELISA RIVIÈRE *University of Minnesota*

SATSUKA, SHIHO. *Nature in translation: Japanese tourism encounters the Canadian Rockies*. xii, 263 pp., map, bibliogr. Durham, N.C.: Duke Univ. Press, 2015. £21.99 (paper)

The subject of the tour guide has a long history in the anthropology of tourism. Since the 1970s, scholars of tourism have recognized the integral role guides play in shaping the touristic experience and in defining the presence and values of tourism at their respective destinations. Shiho Satsuka's study of Japanese tour guides working in the vicinity of Banff National Park makes an informative and unusually detailed contribution to this literature, focusing on the cultural dissonance generated when Japanese nationals elect to move to Canada and become 'translators' of Rocky Mountain 'nature' (*shizen*)

for Japanese tourists vacationing in this world-renowned wilderness area.

Satsuko frames her study as an exercise in Félix Guattari's project of 'ecosophy', articulating ethico-political relationships between environmental, social, and subjective registers of human experience (p. 7). The work is at its best when reporting on the life trajectories, training, and work experiences of the guides themselves. Narratives recounting the individual motivations that inspired guides to leave relatively secure career paths in Japan to risk involving themselves in the uncertainties of seasonal and often hazardous transnational work in the Canadian Rockies are presented in every chapter. Satsuka succeeds admirably in creating engaging profiles that illuminate the larger historical and economic currents of Japanese society and culture, while also recognizing the singular qualities of each individual guide represented in the study. The general findings of the research offer few surprises regarding the ways in which guides have been affected, both professionally and subjectively, by neoliberalism and globalization. However, the discussions of individual guide experiences and their varied understandings of their work, their clientele, their managers, the Canadian locality, and of course themselves offer fresh insights at virtually every turn.

The book's six main chapters each address a general theme in the construction of the Japanese-Canadian nature guide identity. Chapter 1 reflects on the changing post-industrial, post-Cold War Japanese narratives of freedom (*jiyu*) that in the 1980s and 1990s compelled guides to pursue employment in the Canadian Rockies. Chapter 2 focuses on the celebrity Ohashi Kyosen, whose television programmes and stores became a key source for the 'populist cosmopolitanist dream' (pp. 68-9) that dramatically increased the desirability of Canada-focused nature tourism for ordinary (*futsu*) Japanese. Chapter 3 describes how subjectivity is co-modified in Japanese tour guide interactions when guides construct themselves as attractive, even enchanting, figures so as to meet the needs and standards of their clientele. Chapter 4 focuses on gender, casting female Japanese tour guides as fantastical male impersonators and identifying Banff as a space of critical gender play for Japanese guides and tourists alike. Chapters 5 and 6 together address the book's main topic of how Banff's national-park-quality environment is translated by Japanese guides for Japanese clientele.

Satsuka describes in chapter 5 the certification process that Japanese guides underwent in 2002

in order to obtain the credentials legitimizing their interpretative expertise as Banff National Park proceeded to outsource all of its interpretative guiding work. This account is a must-read for scholars of nature tourism. It lays bare the conceptual and cultural disjunctures that occurred in this Canadian-Japanese translation process. Satsuka's even-handed narrative presents the cultural specificity of both the Canadian and the Japanese interpretative projects and shows the puzzles, paradoxes, and opportunities generated by this cosmopolitan-local discourse and its emerging subject formations.

As my discussion indicates, contemporary Japanese society, as it is reflected in the working lives of the Canada-based guides, is Satsuka's central interest. Banff National Park and the locality of Banff itself are described only to the extent necessary to make the Japanese guide's experiences and activities understandable. There is minimal engagement with the anthropological literature on guiding, and Satsuka's few references to the literature on tourism more generally are vague and outdated. This is not a book that could be taught or read as representative of current issues and debates in the anthropology of tourism. Nonetheless, insofar as it brings to life in sympathetic and thought-provoking ways the situation of a distinctive guide subgroup that has operated relatively successfully within a highly specialized niche market in Canada, *Nature in translation* is a useful book, especially for undergraduate readers, not only in relation to the study of globalization and neoliberalism in Japan, but also for the study of transnational forms of nature tourism worldwide.

SALLY ANN NESS *Temple University*

Theory and method

ÅRHEM, KAJ & GUIDO SPRENGER (eds). *Animism in Southeast Asia*. xii, 325 pp., maps, table, figs, bibliogrs. London, New York: Routledge, 2016. £100.00 (cloth)

Various defined, and principally based on South Amerindian and Siberian hunter and gatherer groups, a revised concept of 'animism' now assumes a central position in social anthropology's 'ontological turn'. In contrast, this collection seeks to identify animism in mostly small-scale Southeast Asian societies based socioeconomically on rice cultivation and livestock-raising, where animal sacrifice, head-hunting, and affinal gift exchange practices are central. Whereas 'animism' among

Amerindians and Siberians has been construed with reference to relations between humans and wild animals, these essays are generally concerned with relations between humans and spirits – although, as sacrifices, domestic animals figure in these relationships.

This requires a reconceptualization of ‘animism’, which Århem provides in his introductory chapter. Employing Descola’s scheme of four global ‘ontologies’ (animism, naturalism, totemism, and analogism), Århem accommodates Southeast Asians by refiguring ‘animism’ to include features of ‘analogism’ (a system linking humans and nonhumans through mystical connections rather than by common spirituality or substance). What is specified as ‘animism in its prototypical Southeast Asian form’ is that it is ‘hierarchical’ and ‘transcendent’ – an animism involving spiritual beings and forces (such as the Malay *semangat*) that transcend ordinary experience.

While this reconfiguration apparently maintains a conception of animism as a monistic ontology now embracing a greater range of societies than that implied by earlier reformulations, other essays in the collection point in a quite different direction. Sprenger (chap. 4) states that ascribing personhood (a primary criterion of the new animism) to nonhumans for the Rmeet of Laos is ‘highly selective’ and operative only in ‘particular conditions’ (p. 73), later explaining how ‘objects and animals’ are persons specifically when they are involved in the same exchange networks as humans or spirits (p. 84). Similarly, Remme (chap. 7) notes how, among the Ifagao of Luzon, ‘continuity’ is ‘not a stable feature of relations between humans and non-humans’ but a ‘potential that can be actualized in certain situations’ (p. 141). Sillander (chap. 8) argues that for Borneo’s Bentian animism is an ‘idiom’ that complements a ‘secular and objectifying relationship’ between humans and nonhumans (p. 174). Invoking Descola’s principal ontological contrast, Sillander speaks of the Bentian as ‘vacillating’ between animist and naturalist conceptions in different situations. Similarly Janowski (chap. 9) and Amster (chap. 10), both writing on the Bornean Kelabit (and in Janowski’s case also the Penan), respectively suggest that, like all humans, Kelabit are sometimes ‘naturalists’ (p. 199) and that they ‘perceive’ themselves as either continuous with or separate from ‘the spiritual/natural world’ contextually (p. 215). Kaartinen (chap. 11), writing of Kei islanders and the Huaulu of eastern Indonesia, concludes that Southeast Asia ‘does not fall readily into the

comparative categories . . . so far proposed in the new anthropological debate about animism’. He troublingly observes that the ‘case for animist ontology’ has often been made ‘at the expense of detailed ethnographic comparison’ (pp. 231–2). Where exactly Cederroth (chap. 12 on Lombok’s Islamic Sasak) and Hicks (chap. 13 on southeastern Indonesia’s Bimanese and Nage) fall in this regard is difficult to say, as they barely mention ‘animism’.

Oddly for a volume promoting the induction of Southeast Asia into the animist fold, Ingold’s contribution decries all ‘isms’, calling into question the very concept. The problem with ‘isms’, Ingold argues, is that they assume the pre-existence of knowledge systems handed down from adults to children, whereas what exists may only be ‘ways of being or becoming’ that result in no overall unitary ontology. Ingold suggests that people everywhere sometimes think or behave like ‘naturalists’ and sometimes like ‘animists’. However, rather than disavowing ‘animism’, he instead offers an ‘animic ontogeny’ or ‘animic way’, which entails an immediate presence in, and openness to, experience that ‘goes beyond knowledge’, and which, unlike an ontology, is not the object of any cultural education. ‘People who follow this way’, we are finally told, ‘may be on the way to truth’ (p. 308).

To end on a positive note: this book includes a number of ethnographically detailed and analytically well-articulated essays which should prove valuable to anyone interested in comparative cosmology and forms of symbolic or spiritual knowledge, not just in Southeast Asia but more generally. Ironically, its major merit is the way both the introductory chapters and the case studies that follow reveal not a pervasive ‘animism’ in Southeast Asia, but rather fundamental differences between local representations of relations among humans, spirits, and animals compared to those reported for ‘animists’ elsewhere. Many chapters provide a useful warning to the distortions that follow from applying ‘animism’ as a label for systems of thought and forms of experience supposedly characteristic of whole societies.

GREGORY FORTH *University of Alberta*

CANDEA, MATEI, JOANNA COOK, CATHERINE TRUNDLE & THOMAS YARROW (eds). *Detachment: essays on the limits of relational thinking*. xii, 272 pp., bibliogr. Manchester: Univ. Press, 2015. £70.00 (cloth)

Together with other social sciences, anthropology has tended to celebrate engagement as a social

virtue while disparaging detachment as a positivist vice or a symptom of social irresponsibility. Thinkers as diverse as Sartre, Gramsci, and Bourdieu have argued that intellectuals are responsible for taking a stand on the major political conflicts of their time, thereby keeping faith with Marx and Engel's exhortation that we should not merely interpret the world but change it. However, other critical thinkers, like Adorno and Foucault, have argued that the intellectual should not be 'terrorized into action' (G. Richter, 'Who's afraid of the ivory tower? A conversation with Theodor W. Adorno', *Monatshefte* 94: 1, 2002: 15), and that the task of thinking is not to deliver judgements or foment revolution, but to 'know how and to what extent it might be possible to think differently, instead of legitimating what is already known' (M. Foucault, *The use of pleasure*, 1990: 8-9).

The essays in *Detachment* successfully strike a balance between these two schools of thought, and make a sophisticated case for seeing detachment and engagement not as mutually exclusive moral positions or methodological principles, but as forms of life that must be explained in terms of ethnographic context and pragmatic ends. There are echoes here of the ethnographic method of participant observation, which oscillates between intimate relationships with others and disengagement from the hurly-burly of quotidian life, the better to consider its general features. Since engagement and detachment both have parts to play in the ethnographic project, the question is not one of deciding *which* has priority, but *when* one may be more personally necessary or intellectually edifying than the other.

The editors' introduction to this volume does a splendid job of spelling out the historical conditions under which detachment became synonymous with alienation and engagement became conflated with intersubjectivity. By refusing to ontologize the recurring antinomies of modernist discourse – detachment and engagement, objectivity and subjectivity, science and art, rationality and irrationality, observer and observed – the editors and contributors prioritize the existential contexts in which these terms are foregrounded or backgrounded. Ethical and pragmatic considerations are given more weight than epistemological ones. At stake is what these different discursive strategies accomplish, not whether one is essentially more valid or authentic than the other.

The individual essays repeatedly demonstrate this approach, reminding us that both experience-near and experience-distant

perspectives are vital to anthropological analysis. These studies include compelling examinations of the tension between medical students' experience of dissecting bodies and surgeons who transplant organs; an exploration of attachment and detachment in farmers' relations with their pigs; the dissonance between insider-outsider perspectives in the context of global Christianity; detailed analyses of non-attachment in Tibetan Buddhism and Jainism; a beautiful commentary on disdain and distance in Velázquez's relationship with his subjects; a discussion of the quasi-voyeuristic touristic tension between keeping one's distance and getting involved; and a study of mindfulness as a psychotherapeutic technique.

These chapters are organized into three groups, each followed by a commentary. Veena Das provides an incisive critique of the various forms of detachment – some practically necessary, if not actually virtuous; others examples of bad faith. For Das, the ethics of what we do or do not do is determined by whether it is conducive to life rather than destructive of it. Michael Carrithers discusses the difficulty of reconciling scholarly detachment with personal engagement in 'the messiness of actual social life', and underscores Carolyn Humphrey's point in her essay on Buriad weddings, that while scholarly detachment is a third-person perspective, the Buriad master of ceremonies is committed to an even-handed second-person perspective on those participating in the wedding (p. 170). The implication is that academic detachment can imply an alienation from life, and that second-person forms of dissociation are vital to social well-being. Marilyn Strathern also touches on this point, arguing that detachment does not necessarily imply social separation or alienation; rather it is an *attitude* in which emotions are controlled in order to foster civility and ensure co-operation in everyday life. Accordingly, detachment is a practised mode of relationality and not to be reified as its antithesis. The value of these essays lies in their empirical detail – reminding us that our discursive habit of hypostatizing key terms seldom illuminates, but tends to blind us to the dynamic processes and ever-changing experiences of social existence, which define, after all, the original *raison d'être* of anthropological inquiry.

MICHAEL D. JACKSON *Harvard Divinity School*

COECKELBERGH, MARK. *Money machines: electronic financial technologies, distancing, and responsibility in global finance*. vii, 204 pp., bibliogr. Farnham, Surrey: Ashgate, 2015. £62.99 (cloth)

Mark Coeckelbergh's new book explores the nature of money in the aftermath of the 2008 financial crisis. Coeckelbergh argues that whilst 'we have become increasingly vulnerable to the ebb and flow of global finance ... we know very little about it – let alone about how to tackle the problems' (p. 1). Without that knowledge, he argues, 'we' are left unable to seriously consider what we can do and are left blaming 'them' – namely the bankers and politicians.

Coeckelbergh's range of knowledge across economics, philosophy, and anthropology is an advantage allowing him to do a fine job of introducing readers new to issues of finance and technology to the key issues (with the caveat of a not always convincing 'just-so' story concerning the evolution of money in the early chapters). One of the book's real strengths is his deep understanding of classic thinkers in the field such as Marx and Simmel, who are probably rarely read in contemporary anthropology, but merely filleted for decontextualized quotes in order to back up a position or to provide a convenient straw man against which allegedly new and radical arguments are positioned. Coeckelbergh is able to draw upon their work in order to demonstrate how much of it remains relevant as a guide to understanding the financial technologies of the present, provided that one does not seek to slavishly reproduce every detail of their methodologies. For example, his analysis of the 'distancing' effects of the new technologies of exchange acknowledges a debt to Marx's earlier analyses of the ways in which capitalist commodity exchange tends to create distances between financial actors and the consequences and preconditions of those exchanges. At the same time, he is able to illustrate the particular ways in which electronic technologies of financialization might develop those tendencies whilst simultaneously providing opportunities for their partial amelioration in ways that Marx could never have dreamed of.

The book's major contribution is the development of what Coeckelbergh describes as a 'deep relational' theory of money, which is particularly clearly described in chapter 5 on 'Bitcoin and the metaphysics of money'. Coeckelbergh contrasts this perspective with what he describes as various 'ontological' theories of money, all of which have their virtues, but also have corresponding drawbacks. 'Object ontology' often reinforces a dualistic worldview that assumes the utility of distinctions such as that between 'real' and 'virtual': a distinction that is often philosophically problematic in general, but

that is obviously of particular salience in debates around the emergence of new financial technologies such as *bitcoin*. 'Information ontology' overcomes the dualism by proposing that all phenomena (real or virtual) are ultimately forms of information. However, in doing so, it proposes a singular 'ultimate' informational reality, making it 'more normative than it pretends to be' (p. 96), and therefore implicitly relying upon an observational position independent of human subjectivity. 'Social ontology', particularly of the kind to be found in the work of John Searle, overcomes these problems by making the social as much part of the real as the physical or the material, while crucially exploring the role of language (and, by implication, human subjectivity) in shaping the nature of the entities, such as gold bars or *bitcoin* codes, that are under examination. Even this step, however, falls short in Coeckelbergh's eyes, as ultimately it remains dualistic in its reliance upon a conceptual distinction between objective and subjective aspects of reality. In contrast, Coeckelbergh offers a relational view of financial technologies, including money. This approach, he argues, moves beyond the ontological perspectives that offer a weak relational view, which ultimately focuses on the *relata* not the relations, to an 'epistemological' position less concerned with defining the essence of entities, such as money, than with outlining how 'the ontology game is *itself* one particular way of perceiving and constructing such entities' (p. 100). The claim that we need to transcend ontological questions in order to interrogate the deeper epistemological questions that underpin them may raise a few eyebrows in some quarters of contemporary anthropology, which is only now leaving behind the tendency to rebrand conventionally epistemological questions as ontological in the hope that this will somehow make them deeper, heavier, and more essential. However, Coeckelbergh's view of money as a technology of relationality that shortens some geographical and temporal distances, whilst simultaneously widening moral and social gaps, is one that clearly both draws upon and has much to offer to anthropological debates on the nature of finance and money.

KEIR JAMES CECIL MARTIN *University of Oslo*

FALLS, SUSAN. *Clarity, cut, and culture: the many meanings of diamonds*. 216 pp., illus., figs, bibliogr. New York: Univ. Press, 2014. £20.99 (paper)

In this very readable book, Susan Falls skilfully unpicks the symbolism and emotions associated with diamonds – discussing their value, as well as the romance, devotion, success, and respectability they convey – and the ways in which these can be reappropriated. Falls argues that despite their historical significance or any modern mass marketing campaigns, wearing and buying diamonds involves, and enables, creative agency on the part of the wearer/consumer. To prove this, she weaves a fascinating array of voices and viewpoints into her narrative in ways that maintain the character of each person and allow them to speak for themselves, yet which enable interpretation.

Having witnessed the multiplicity of ways in which people emotionally engage with, and explain, their diamond ownership, Falls explains that branding has 'not been able to establish a privileged semiotic ideology by which consumers always interpret diamonds as symbols referring to the values that marketers promote' (p. 10). She acknowledges, however, that branding provides a framework for thinking about how other people are using things as symbols. In other words, we may have our own reasons for wearing diamonds, but we still will be judged *vis-à-vis* the framework created by the diamond marketers. Whilst acknowledging that individual creative agency is therefore important, a greater acknowledgement of the power of those external structural judgements in the face of an individual's resistance would have strengthened Fall's argument. After all, if it matters only to a person and their friends, to what extent can resistance be seen as effective opposition?

In discussing the interviews that form the book's ethnography, Falls states explicitly that she did not request information about salary, class, age, religion, sexual orientation, marital status, or the value of the diamonds in question. This is a refreshing way of not being bound by traditional sociological categories, but becomes an issue in the chapter on diamonds as 'bling' – a phenomenon often associated in the United States with black consumers. Falls states in chapter 5 that she is exploring white middle-class interpretations of bling and has not interviewed hip-hop artists owing to her interest in how celebrities influence consumers, rather than in how stars interpret their own diamonds. However, what about all the middle- or working-class black consumers who find ways to buy a cheap diamond? Surely they may be influenced by celebrities, and therefore their voices very much need to be heard here, especially as this may raise questions as to whether it is race or class that is

most influential in the interpretation of bling.

That said, one of this book's strengths is the way it delves into and sensitively analyses diamond-wearers' complicated feelings. It remains the case, nonetheless, that these data cannot be quite as divorced from an analysis of the diamond industry as Falls argues. At certain points, interviewees spontaneously mention the industry's unethical aspects, and more emphasis on this and the ways in which such opinions affect the wearing and buying of diamonds would have been interesting. The Kimberley Process, an international certification system designed to ensure that jewellers are not selling 'blood' diamonds, is mentioned briefly, without considering the ways in which the consumer desire for diamonds still fuels an illicit diamond industry. Indeed, the explanation of how Sir Cecil Rhodes enabled de Beers to almost completely take over the diamond industry makes for particularly interesting reading, especially as, beyond looking for profit, his aim was to recolonize Africa for Britain. The politics of this situation, in terms of both colonialism and capitalistic monopolies that continue to the present day, are downplayed.

Overall, this is an engaging account of a controversial commodity which not only pieces together consumer emotions and behaviour, but also analyses them through both classic and more recent anthropological theory. There are useful, accessible, and knowledgeable sections that explore classic gift/commodity and consumption models (i.e. Bourdieu, Mauss), alongside more recent thinkers such as Fred Myers and David Graeber. There is also a brief use of semiotics, with Falls celebrating Peirce's model for its ability to 'keenly embrace' subjectivity. Then there is a very interesting application of Russian Formalism and the concept of *ostranenie* (or defamiliarization) to bling. This makes for a well-informed and wide-ranging mix of references, applied to this case study in original ways that are engaging for the advanced scholar, and enticing for the less advanced one. There is no doubt that, as a whole, this book makes a significant contribution to the growing collection of literature on specific commodities.

ALISON HULME *University of Northampton*

FRIEDMAN, KAJSA EKHOLM & JONATHAN

FRIEDMAN. *Historical transformations: the anthropology of global systems*. vi, 322 pp., tables, figs, bibliogr. Plymouth: AltaMira Press, 2014. £22.95 (paper)

Historical transformations offers several hypotheses on the dynamics of how social structures reproduce and change over time. The Friedmans use what they variously call transformational analysis, a global systemic framework, and global systemic analysis, while drawing on their key concepts of social reproduction and global processes. They criticize rival theories for their presumed failure to recognize that all societies and cultures are in reality encompassed by a larger, global system. Furthermore, they stress that the ways in which all societies and cultures maintain and reproduce themselves are shaped by this all-encompassing global system.

This work is a collection of eleven papers written by the Friedmans, mostly spanning the two decades from 1976 to 1996. It offers a series of exemplary case studies that fill in and parallel the arguments presented earlier in Jonathan Friedman's *Cultural identity and global process* (1994). It is a companion volume to the Friedmans' *Modernities, class, and the contradictions of globalization* (2008), which also bears the subtitle *The anthropology of global systems*. In a sense, these three books form a trilogy. They reflect a common theoretical argument and draw on many of the same examples, but they are not always clearly differentiated because the term 'global' is used in multiple ways. However, the *Modernities* volume does focus more on the contemporary world; the *Historical transformations* volume ranges widely in time and space; and the *Cultural identity* volume focuses more on the personal history of the Friedmans' theory of the global.

In many respects the present work can be read as an analytical history of much recent anthropological theory, from Marxism to postmodernism and globalization theories. The authors are also self-critical throughout, tracking and evaluating the development of their own approach in the introductions to both each part and the individual chapters. Part one lays out the original argument. Part two, more than half of the total book, considers large, long-term transformations including provocative models of the development of imperialist civilizations, ancient world systems, and the rise and fall of Bronze Age civilizations. In this last, Kaja Friedman explains the Bronze Age collapse as resulting from the particular way in which these societies had originally developed and not as resulting from external factors such as invasions from the outside. Part three presents ethno-historical case studies from Central Africa and Oceania.

Chapter 8 shows how details of kinship and marriage in the sixteenth-century Congo kingdoms may have been transformed by the effects of the European-centred slave trade on their existing prestige-goods systems. In this case, the global system is the modern commercial world, and the global process involves expanding capitalist strategies. What gets lost in this overall approach is the possibility that there are indeed significant differences in sociocultural systems of different scale, and that these differences may be related to contemporary human problems. Detailed cultural history and ethnography are offered by the Friedmans as better explanations for the origins of matri- and patrilineages and different systems of marriage alliance than the classic interpretations offered by British functionalists, American neo-evolutionists, or cultural materialists. I prefer to see all these alternative approaches as complementary, rather than mutually exclusive.

There are certainly many useful insights to be gained from a more global view, but here it is posed as a contentious new idea that until recently was widely rejected because most anthropologists preferred to view societies and cultures as isolates. For the Friedmans, developing and championing their framework required a decades-long struggle against a range of competing theories they considered erroneous, or 'intellectually flawed'. The combative tone here calls into question the validity of a great deal of conventional anthropology. In most cases, beyond conquest and colonialism, the global connections they refer to involve the virtually universal intermarriage of trade occurring between peoples. Few anthropologists have been unaware of such intergroup realities.

One of the benefits of this approach is that it interrogates the concept of cultural hybridity as a way of understanding globalization as the diffusion of cultural elements in the contemporary world. The focus on social reproduction calls attention to the human dimension of sociocultural systems in daily life, especially at the domestic level. It is also worth noting that there are relevant alternatives to the Friedmans' perspectives on the dynamics of cultural change, including this reviewer's own power and scale theory of elite-directed growth ('Revisionism in ecological anthropology', *Current Anthropology* **38**: 4, 1997) and Peter Turchin *et al.*'s cultural evolutionary model ('War, space, and the evolution of Old World complex societies', *PNAS* **110**: 41, 2013).

JOHN H. BODLEY *Washington State University*

GUICHARD, MARTINE, TILO GRÄTZ & YOUSOUF DIALLO (eds). *Friendship, descent and alliance in Africa: anthropological perspectives*. 211 pp., bibliogr. Oxford, New York: Berghahn Books, 2014. £67.00 (cloth)

The overall aim of *Friendship, descent and alliance in Africa*, set out in the introduction, is to examine how the continent's friendship patterns are influenced by kinship rules. The editors dismiss former conceptualizations of friendship and kinship as mutually exclusive; instead they examine them in conjunction. This analytical perspective has been partly alluded to in the previous, if rare, ethnographies of friendship (e.g. S. Bell & S. Coleman, *The anthropology of friendship*, 1999; A. Desai & E. Killick, *The ways of friendship*, 2010), but has not been explored thoroughly, especially in African, kin-based contexts. The collection is divided into three parts, relating friendship to five themes: firstly to kinship and age, then to ethnicity, and finally to politics and urbanity.

The first two chapters shed light on how aspects of kinship such as patterns of inheritance, post-nuptial residence, modes of descent (Martine Guichard's chapter), as well as changing rules of clan and the incest taboo (Paul Spencer's chapter), impact on friendships. In addition, Guichard's chapter asks 'which kin make better friends?' and examines issues of closeness and distance. It argues that distant kin, for example brothers-in-law, are more likely to become one's friends as these relations are less prone to competition and to the risk of conflicting obligations or interests. This chapter also identifies the language used (friends are often called sisters or brothers), and the secrecy under which friendships are kept as methodological challenges to the study of friendship, particularly in African contexts.

The chapters in the second part explore inter-ethnic friendships, a subject on which little work has been done to date, partly because – as mentioned by Guichard – different idioms used to refer to intra-ethnic and inter-ethnic friendship might have concealed their existence and relevance. Yet, despite kin ties, these friendships can be, for example, a key strategy for survival, as shown in chapters by Wolde Gossa Tadesse and Guichard, and by Tilo Grätz. Tadesse and Guichard's chapter argues that formal inter-ethnic friendships provide networks not merely of trade, but also of subsistence for groups at the margins of market economy in southwestern Ethiopia. Grätz's chapter shows how inter-ethnic friendship mitigates uncertainty and precarity amongst

young labour migrants in northern Benin's gold mines. It also highlights the moral dimension of inter-ethnic friendship and, more interestingly, its limits.

The third section moves on to analyse friendship and kinship in political and urban contexts. The chapters by Richard Warms and Richard Werbner both argue that friendship and kinship are not inversely related in urban contexts. Rather, in Mali (Warms' chapter), friends are converted into kin for economic ends, as is the case among Sikasso merchants, as much as friends can help escape kin ties, as in the case for Bougouni war veterans. Werbner's chapter, in turn, argues that urban friendships actually enhance one's capacity to meet kin obligations. Whereas this chapter shows how friendships in Botswana elite circles are enmeshed within postcolonial state formation, Warms' chapter sheds light on how friendship networks can be crucial where strong political (and economic) structures are lacking.

Although, as the editors note (p. 2), the chapters allow for cross-referencing, the volume would have benefited from a more focused investigation of some of the core themes in different chapters. By relating friendship to five themes, the volume's eight chapters – individually standing as insightful – seem to reach out in too many directions. This is partly addressed in Stephen Reyna's afterword, which introduces yet another theme, friendship and class difference, and then brings together the diverse chapters under the concept of power, thus rendering the volume more coherent. Moreover, even though the editors underline that friendships are products of contemporary social structures (p. 2), some aspects of the modern African context are missing: for example, how social media and mobile phones transform friendship and kinship relations. Moreover, the introduction identifies the male bias in previous studies of friendship (p. 5), yet the volume does little to address this issue.

Given that friendship still remains under-researched in anthropology, this volume adds to the two edited volumes on the subject, especially by widening the ground for ethnographic comparison as it focuses on Africa, a region little represented in previous studies. By illustrating the variety of ways in which kinship and friendship interrelate, this collection's essays make a convincing case for a joint analysis of kinship and friendship; highlighting issues of power, generation, the plural character of friendship; and political, economic, and social transformations (p. 13) as new directions for future research. I recommend the volume to

anyone interested in African studies, anthropology, and the sociology of friendship.
EWA MAJCAK *University of Oxford*

MORRIS, BRIAN (introduction by PETER MARSHALL).
Anthropology, ecology, and anarchism: a Brian Morris reader. xx, 252 pp, bibliogr. London: PM Press, 2015. £21.99 (paper)

'Before there was "anarchist anthropology", there was Brian Morris'. So says the blurb by the political writer Gabriel Kuhn at the front of this book. Now in his early eighties, Brian Morris remains one of the most exciting writers in our discipline, through decades of writings on a variety of topics. The title is well chosen, for it puts together his early interests in natural history and ecology with later ideas in anthropology and anarchism. I say 'later', although these interests date at least from the 1960s and especially the 1970s, when he studied anthropology at the London School of Economics, doing field research with the Malaipantaram of South India.

Morris spent his youth as a tea planter in Malawi and ended up as an authority on hunter-gatherers of South India. There are certainly hints of these interests here, though the emphasis is on anarchist thought. Morris's form of anarchism is decidedly of a libertarian socialist sort. His various interests in religions and philosophy come through as well, though perhaps less so his other interests in insects, fungi, and the like. Whatever he is, Morris is a polymath. Yet here his ideas on the form of anarchism he espouses, and indeed on other forms of anarchism, are given enough prominence to merit the description of this as mainly a book about that political philosophy.

In essence, this volume is a series of fifteen essays written between 1985 and 2013, and mainly since the year 2000. They are placed in chronological order and reflect less a change in viewpoint and more, in spite of Morris's eclectic interests, a coherent framework of first-rate anthropological thinking. Apart from the first essay, which to me seems weaker than the others, and perhaps the second, dated 1997, which begins with the now *passé* statement that '[p]ostmodernism is now all the rage in anthropology', they get better and better. Let me concentrate on just two of the essays in this volume.

One I particularly like is on the forgotten anarcho-syndicalist Rudolf Rocker (1873-1958). I had not known much about him before, but

Rocker was extraordinary in the anarchist tradition. He was branded an 'old' anarchist of the libertarian socialist tradition by some of the 'new' anarchists of the anti-globalization movement. Yet Rocker was in fact rather more than his trendy critics give him credit for. He did not believe that anarchism is a final goal, because he rejected the idea of any final goal. Like Peter Kropotkin, he found anarchist thought in existence throughout history, and he believed in a socialism based on voluntary principles. Thus he rejected the Marxist tradition. Rocker also held that there was an inverse relation between culture and power and that the 'nation' was less an imagined community and more of an artefact related to the existence of the modern state. Morris does a wonderful job both of giving us a good snippet of Rocker's biography and of offering a sympathetic critique of Rocker's political philosophy.

Another essay I like is 'Kropotkin and the poststructuralist critique of anarchism', one of two about Peter Kropotkin. This is less biographical than the Rocker essay, and concentrates instead on bringing out Morris's own anarchist critique of the poststructuralist critique. Kropotkin, born a Russian prince and eventually becoming a geographer, is well known to anthropologists, thanks to his 1902 book *Mutual aid*. Morris emphasizes Kropotkin's evolutionism, his ecological worldview, and his place among followers of Enlightenment thinking. Being a child of the Enlightenment is, of course, anathema to poststructuralists. Morris's treatment is full of bibliographical material as well as insightful analysis.

The introduction by philosopher and historian Peter Marshall describes Morris's background and comments on his essays. While not really essential for those who already know Morris's extensive work, Marshall's introduction will no doubt be useful to those who do not. In this review I have only had space to scratch the surface, but *Anthropology, ecology, and anarchism* is a splendid volume that easily can be recommended to anthropologists and to students. Morris is always provocative, giving us plenty to think about and to debate. I am not an anarchist myself, but if I were going to be one, then I would like to be one like Brian Morris. His writing style is full of insight, and it makes for pleasant and easy reading.

ALAN BARNARD *University of Edinburgh*

SCHNEIDER, ARND & CHRISTOPHER WRIGHT (eds).
Anthropology and art practice. xxiv, 168 pp., tables, illus., plates, bibliogr. London: Bloomsbury, 2013. £21.99 (paper)

Schneider and Wright have already co-edited a pair of well-received books examining the art/anthropology nexus. In their latest joint effort they bring us up to date on contemporary experiments across this interdisciplinary zone. They want to go beyond the established practice wherein anthropologists of art focus on objects, their contexts, and aesthetics, whether locally or globally, while artists are only taken into account as producers of the finished items studied. Instead of upholding a tired distinction between professional anthropologists and practising artists, they wish to interrogate the interaction between the two.

In their opening chapter, Schneider and Wright argue that much modern art strives to prod at conventionalized patterns of thinking to elicit novel responses from audiences. This turn to the public dovetails with artists' ideas about engaging others in collaborative work. It is in this context that Bourriaud's notion of 'relational aesthetics' has come to the fore. All this is promising stuff, but Schneider and Wright raise justified worries that some practitioners may only pay lip-service to collaboration. The new rhetoric's rise is not enough in itself to displace entrenched positions.

Besides examining critical collaboration and new modes of participatory practice, Schneider and Wright emphasize the shift, by some artists, from an obsession with product to a focus on process: the making becomes more important than the made, perhaps much more so. Accordingly, they characterize many of their contributors' work as probing, exploratory, and often fragmentary or open-ended, which does not matter if we are more concerned with the 'how' than the 'what'. Hence Schneider and Wright consider how artists adapt ethnographic procedures for their innovative ends, and how visual anthropologists look to artistic practice for new ways to research and represent the social. The common aim is to develop novel, informative modes of investigating and portraying the thus far unstudied. Consequently, the bulk of the book is a series of short chapters exemplifying and reflecting on these experiments. Below I consider my personal favourites.

In chapter 2 Craig Campbell researches the dimensions, literal and metaphorical, of the Siberian winter's twilight world: light's distinctive quality during night-long days, and the illuminating effects of Soviet films projected onto the sides of tents. It is a world of shadows and indistinct figures enlightened by moving pictures. Juan Orrautia's goal in *Entrada prohibida* (chap. 3) is to produce an evocative documentary, a sense

of industrial intimacy in a Mozambican derelict dock. Informed by narrative ethnography, he produces a portraiture of place, seeing ports as spaces with nostalgic elements that speak to the futuristic and the melancholic.

Did you know Nicaragua was once ruled by a dictator from the United States? Kathryn Ramsey uncovers this surreal episode in Latin American history through her experimental film (chap. 7). Against a bare backdrop of data, she queries the processes of representing history and viewing film, since she sees both as equally constructed, and wants to make us distrust documentary and anthropological convention. Robert Willim goes further in 'Reflections on elsewhere' (chap. 8). His exploratory films are imaginative geographies of cities never visited by him or his collaborator. He classes his creations as 'more aimless than mainstream ethnography'. Valuing uncertainty and play, Willim likes to leave room for the intractable; he seeks to engender chance and the provisional.

Brad Butler and Karen Mirza (chap. 9) want to explore non-participatory practices, and so challenge current conditions of political involvement and resistance. The questions they set themselves are: how are we to make withdrawal visible, and non-participation active and critical? They curate a 'Museum of Non-Participation', which, via disruption, collects places of non-violence, fatigue, silence, absence, and in the process questions exhibitionary modes. In contrast, Yvette Brackman provides a developed example of collaborative production (chap. 14). Working together with Russian Sami, she produces a variety of artworks in which the process of decision-making is as important as the results. She claims this approach leans on Brechtian 'learning plays', Soviet agitation techniques, and constructivist artists' designs for celebratory crockery: quite a genealogy.

Other contributors investigate the possibilities of occupational fieldwork in offices; collaborative videos of Aboriginal Christmases; digital projects fleshing out colonial conflict along the Canadian Northwest Coast; assembling soundscapes in an organic farm under the flightpath of a Japanese airport; varying film speeds to clarify the emotions of Gypsy dancers; and co-working with migrants to make a sensorial visual ethnography. Art practice is the lead discipline here, with anthropology playing catch-up. Perhaps that is as it should be in what is a fun book, useful for anthropologists of art and students who need provoking.

JEREMY MACCLANCY *Oxford Brookes University*

SCIAMA, LIDIA DINA (ed.). *Humour, comedy and laughter: obscenities, paradoxes, insights and the renewal of life*. ix, 209 pp., illus., bibliogr. Oxford, New York: Berghahn Books, 2016. £56.00 (cloth)

Humour, comedy and laughter is an edited volume with nine chapters, each dealing with a different topic. Most of the chapters are by anthropologists, with some exceptions giving the book a somewhat cross-disciplinary view. The introduction written by Lidia Sciamia gives a good overview of the research on humour, introducing some of the main theories as well as the ways humour resists definition. The introduction notes the variety of topics in the book, ranging from ancient texts to science fiction films, picking up on different possible aspects of humour for researchers to consider, such as criticism, aesthetics, and politics.

Ian Wilkie and Matthew Saxton's essay, 'The origins of comic performance in adult-child interaction' (chap. 1), discusses the development of humour as a child grows, noting that the development of language and a sense of humour go hand in hand. They also make comparisons to adult humour, showing how aspects of children's humour, such as surprise within a familiar setting or repetition, can be found in the work of comedians.

Judith Okely's chapter, 'Learning from the ludic', discusses anthropological methods, fieldwork, and various ways the ludic can emerge in the field. She critically notes that while the ludic is often a part of fieldwork, there can be a tendency to aim for 'a stiff upper lip' and a pretence at being scientific 'in the name of an absurd notion of research and science as distant and planned, fixed trajectory' (p. 41). Elisabeth Hsu discusses humour as a mode of cognition and how present-day interpretations of ancient Chinese texts are enhanced by the possibility that the texts are meant to be funny. This text brings up how humour as an interpretative frame can radically change a text's meanings.

'Comic strips and the makings of American identity', by Ian Rakoff, covers several decades of comic strips in the United States and how the subject matter relates to each era's social context, revealing the tensions of misogyny and racism underpinning these tales of heroic exploits. The next chapter, 'Humour, stress and power in an

Anglo-German bank branch', written by Fiona Moore, discusses a situation where joking has a role in creating solidarity within and across a social divide, but also can create boundaries – depending on the situation, who is present, and who is doing the joking. Moore points to the complexity and flexibility of joking in a potentially fraught situation. Dolores P. Martinez writes about humour, dreams, and science fiction. She argues that sci-fi is about modern identities and the search for ways of being human in a barely imaginable future, offering a chance to cope by laughing at deep anxieties.

The chapter by Shirley Ardener on the English Christmas pantomime is mostly focused on the gender-bending aspects of the genre, how women play boys' roles and how men play the 'dame'. The discussion includes examples from interviews with the men who play dames, and incorporates both a description and a history of the genre. Glauco Sanga describes satire in Italian popular song, noting that there is a great deal of it, while examining how it touches on central aspects of social life such as family relations.

In the final chapter, 'Laughing at the past among Venetian islanders', Sciamia describes how the inhabitants of a certain Venetian island have been made fun of; how this has been used by playwrights; and how the islanders have reclaimed their comic identity through their own interpretations. Sciamia ties her discussion to theory and humour more generally while considering the views of both an eighteenth-century writer and present-day islanders. Sciamia's text is also a good example of accomplishing the difficult feat of writing about comedy so that it still breathes.

This book is a valuable contribution to the anthropology on humour as there is so little of it, despite the important place of humorous phenomena within social life. The wide variety of topics reflects the myriad ways humour may figure in different contexts: how in some cases it is an important aspect of the situation in question and in others it provides a specific lens through which to consider a topic. At the same time, the chapters are a bit uneven in terms of how much they engage with previous humour research. I am glad to see humour emerging as a more visible theme in anthropology; perhaps the next step will be to develop further our theoretical views on it.

MARIANNE PÄIVIKKI KEISALO *Aarhus University*